

Thomas Burri

The Greatest Possible Freedom

Interpretive formulas and their spin in
free movement case law



Nomos

<https://doi.org/10.5771/9783845265490-1>, am 17.07.2024, 22:35:31
Open Access –  – <https://www.nomos-elibrary.de/agb>



Thomas Burri

The Greatest Possible Freedom

*Interpretive formulas and their spin in
free movement case law*

Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft

Thomas Burri is an assistant professor of international and European law at the University of St. Gallen (HSG) in Switzerland. He received his education as a lawyer at the Universities of Basel and Zurich, as well as at the College of Europe in Bruges. This book was written while on research stays at Harvard University and the Ludwig-Maximilians-University in Munich. Thomas Burri previously published a book on the rights of minorities ('Models of Autonomy? Case-Studies of Minority Regimes in Hungary and French Polynesia') as well as articles in various international and European law journals and books. Webpage: www.thomas-burri.com.

Die Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data is available in the Internet at <http://dnb.d-nb.de>

a.t.: St. Gallen, Univ., Habil., 2015

ISBN 978-3-8487-2391-1 (Print)
978-3-8452-6549-0 (ePDF)

British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-3-8487-2391-1 (Print)
978-3-8452-6549-0 (ePDF)

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Burri, Thomas

The Greatest Possible Freedom

Interpretive formulas and their spin in free movement case law

Thomas Burri

606 p.

Includes bibliographic references and index.

ISBN 978-3-8487-2391-1 (Print)
978-3-8452-6549-0 (ePDF)

1. Edition 2015

© Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft, Baden-Baden, Germany 2015. Printed and bound in Germany.

This work is subject to copyright. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or any information storage or retrieval system, without prior permission in writing from the publishers. Under § 54 of the German Copyright Law where copies are made for other than private use a fee is payable to "Verwertungsgesellschaft Wort", Munich.

No responsibility for loss caused to any individual or organization acting on or refraining from action as a result of the material in this publication can be accepted by Nomos or the author.

Für Lotti und Kaspar

Table of Contents

A	Introduction: The way to the greatest possible freedom	17
	I Free movement of persons and services: 1400 decisions	17
	II The structure of the book	19
	III Why is the first part on ‘the case-law’ necessary? Why not cover more interpretive formulas?	20
	IV A text-based approach	21
	V Why is this book useful and novel?	22
	VI An illustration of how this book is different from other works	25
	VII What this book is not	27
B	The case-law	29
	I The 1960s	29
	II The 1970s	34
	1 Workers	34
	A first wave of cases: 34 – The year 1975: 36 – The remain- ing years of the decade: 36	
	2 Establishment	38
	3 Social security	39
	Aggregation and apportionment: 39 – Niemann and Petroni: 41 – Other aggregation: 43 – Aggregation and third states: 43 – Social security v. social assistance: 44 – Definitions and scope: 45 – Personal scope: 45 – Family: 46 – Unemploy- ment: 47 – Sickness: 49 – Non-discrimination and resi- dence: 49 – One legislation: 50 – Transition and technicali- ties: 51	
	4 Services	52
	III The 1980s	53
	1 Workers	53
	Advantages: 55 – Educational advantages: 55 – Mainte- nance grants: 56 – Family members: 57 – Derogations: 58 – No violation of non-discrimination: 60 – Diploma recognition: 61 – The Ankara Agreement: 61 – Enlarge- ment: 61 – Technicalities, purely internal situations: 62	
	2 Establishment	63
	1985: 64 – 1986: 64 – 1987: 65 – 1988 and 1989: 65 – Purely internal situations and remainders: 66 – Companies: 67 – Diploma: 67	

3	Social security	68
	Definitions and scope: 68 – Social security v. social assistance: 69 – Further issues of definition: 70 – Aggregation and apportionment: 71 – Benefits of the same kind and rules against overlapping: 72 – Further aggregation: 74 – Aggregation and third states: 75 – Short periods of insurance and other intricacies: 76 – Recalculation: 77 – Aggregation and conditions of affiliation: 77 – Overlapping benefits, supplements: 79 – Adding to the disparities: 81 – More supplements: 82 – Unemployed frontier workers: 83 – Atypical frontier workers: 84 – Exporting unemployment benefits: 85 – A Kafka novel: 86 – Sickness: 86 – Applicable legislation: 87 – Non-discrimination and residence: 88 – The Dutch transition: 89 – Further non-discrimination: 90 – Technicalities: 91	
4	Services	93
	Broadcasting: 93 – Posted workers: 94 – Variety: 95 – Infringement in the insurance sector: 96 – Public works: 96 – Lawyers: 96 – Broadcasting again: 97 – Remuneration: 98 – Transport services: 98 – Tourists: 98	
IV	The 1990s	98
1	Workers and citizens	99
	Worker: 99 – Advantages: 100 – Education: 102 – Taxes: 103 – Derogations: 105 – Non-discrimination: 106 – Union citizenship: 107 – Ankara: 108 – Technicalities: 110 – Purely internal situations: 112 – Transition and remainders: 113	
2	Establishment	114
	Ships and aircrafts: 114 – Doctors: 116 – Purely internal situations: 116 – Taxation: 118 – Official authority: 119 – Names: 119 – Gebhard: 119 – Driving licences: 120 – Sunday trading: 120 – Non-profit: 121 – Austria: 121 – Non-discrimination: 122 – Legal persons: 122 – Technicalities: 124 – Secondary law as to companies and further technicalities: 125 – Diploma: 126	
3	Social Security	129
	Scope and definitions: 129 – Social security v. assistance: 129 – Conventions with third states: 130 – Further scope: 130 – Scope and applicable legislation: 131 – Ceasing occupation: 132 – Derived rights: 133 – Special non-contributory benefits, social assistance: 135 – Farming: 135 – (Not) purely internal situations: 135 – Monopoly, periods of insurance: 136 – Applicable legislation: 136 – Aggregation: 138 – Previous conventions: 141 – Changing circumstances: 142 – Benefits of the same kind, overlapping: 145 – Aggregation in Spain:	

146 – Aggregation and special non-contributory benefits:	
147 – Differing retirement ages: 147 – Aggregation and civil servants:	
147 – Broader aggregation: 148 – Family benefits:	
150 – After Pinna: 151 – More family benefits: 152 – Post Rossi:	
154 – Unemployment: 156 – Sickness and invalidity:	
159 – Non-discrimination and residence: 161 – Third states:	
164 – Ankara: 166 – Technicalities: 167 – Subrogation: 167 – Social security more broadly: 168	
4 Services	169
Posted workers: 169 – Tourist guides: 170 – Lawyers: 171 – Säger:	
172 – Broadcasting: 172 – No connection to services, purely internal: 175 – Public works: 176 – Various services: 177 – Games of chance: 178 – Maritime transport: 179 – Again various services: 180 – Medical services: 182 – Taxation: 183 – Public procurement: 185 – Further services cases: 186	
V The 2000s	188
1 Workers and citizens	188
Worker: 188 – Advantages: 189 – Family members: 190 – Family members and Union citizenship: 191 – Union citizenship, minimex, and students: 192 – Education without Union citizenship: 194 – Tideover allowance and Union citizenship: 194 – Job seekers and Union citizenship: 195 – Genuine link again: 195 – War victims and Union citizenship: 195 – Union citizenship and expulsion: 196 – Names and Union citizenship: 196 – Union citizenship and institutional issues: 197 – Union citizenship and other policies: 197 – Taxation: 198 – Taxes and houses: 199 – Cohesion of the tax system: 200 – Taxation of employees of the Communities: 201 – Taxes and Union citizenship: 201 – Taxes on cars: 202 – Taxes and real estate: 202 – Interim assistance and taxation: 203 – Derogations: 203 – Sufficient resources: 205 – Non-discrimination: 205 – Car registration: 207 – Further non-discrimination: 207 – Ankara: 208 – Ankara more favourable than the internal market: 211 – Agreements with other third states: 212 – Technicalities: 214 – Driving licences: 214 – Purely internal situations: 216	
2 Establishment	217
Dentists: 217 – Opticians: 218 – Psychotherapists: 219 – Pharmacies: 219 – Lawyers: 220 – Pay slips for workers: 222 – Games of chance: 222 – Taxation: 223 – Car registration: 226 – Diploma: 226 – Private security: 227 – Bovine semen: 227 – Family members: 228 – Cars: 228 – Ankara: 229 – Europe Agreements: 229 – Switzerland: 231 – Purely in-	

	ternal situations: 231 – Secondary law: 231 – Open skies: 232 – Legal persons and taxation: 232 – Dividends: 233 – Incorporation: 233 – Taxation of capital gains and profits: 234 – Sight account with banks: 235 – Ship registration: 235 – Taxation of groups: 236 – Cross-border merger: 236 – Further companies, taxation (2006): 237 – More dividends case-law: 238 – Companies and third countries: 239 – Further group cases: 240 – Inheritance tax: 241 – Taxation of limited partnerships: 241 – More dividends: 241 – Currency loss: 241 – Expenses for research and development: 242 – Further group taxation: 242 – Moving the seat: 245 – Secondary law re companies: 246 – Diploma recognition in 2000-2002: 246 – Diploma recognition in 2003-2004: 249 – Diploma recognition in 2005-2006: 251 – Diploma recognition in 2007-2009: 252	
3	Social security	255
	Scope and definitions: 255 – Special non-contributory benefits: 256 – Annex issues: 259 – Further scope and definitions: 260 – Applicable legislation: posted workers: 261 – One legislation: 262 – Ceasing occupation: 264 – Two legislations: 265 – Aggregation: 265 – Aggregation and child-rearing in Austria: 267 – Aggregation and employment with the Community: 268 – Further aggregation: 268 – Sickness benefits, medical services: 269 – Pensioners and sickness benefits: 272 – Unemployment benefits: 273 – Exporting unemployment benefits: 275 – Unemployed frontier workers: 275 – Family benefits: 276 – Family benefits and pensioners: 278 – Non-discrimination: 278 – Agreements with third countries, Ankara: 281 – Technicalities: 283 – Further social security cases: 284	
4	Services	285
	Posted workers: 285 – Construction business: 286 – More posted workers: 286 – Medical services: 291 – Games of chance: 295 – Taxes: 296 – Private security firms: 306 – Leased cars: 308 – Maritime transport: 309 – Broadcasting: 312 – Public procurement: 316 – Ankara: 322 – Further services cases: 323 – Services more broadly: 335	
VI	The 2010s	337
1	Workers and citizens	337
	Advantages: 337 – Residence: 339 – Taxation: 340 – Family members: 344 – Collective agreement: 344 – Non-discrimination: 345 – Driving licences: 347 – Ankara: 348 – Bulgaria: 352 – Union citizenship: 352 – Union citizenship and students: 353 – Permanent residence: 354 – Union citizenship and expulsion: 356 – Union citizenship and names: 356 – (Not) purely	

internal situations, family reunification of Union citizens: 358 – Union citizens and prohibition to leave: 361 – Union citizenship and the broader family: 362 – The Union citizenship of a president: 362 – Issues left open re Union citizenship: 363 – Further cases: 363	
2 Establishment	364
Taxes: 364 – Pharmacies: 364 – Laboratories: 365 – Games of chance: 366 – Car insurance: 367 – Lawyers, notaries, and courts: 368 – Non-discrimination: 369 – Ankara and other Agreements with third states: 371 – Technicalities: 372 – Legal persons and taxation: 372 – Further company cases: 378 – Companies and third states: 379 – Diploma: 381	
3 Social security	382
Scope and definitions: 382 – Special non-contributory benefits: 384 – Discrimination: 385 – Applicable legislation: 385 – Sickness: 387 – Aggregation: 389 – Unemployment: 389 – Family benefits: 390 – Aggregation more broadly: 392 – Ankara: 392	
4 Services	393
Posted workers: 393 – Games of chance: 395 – Medical services: 399 – Taxes: 401 – Telecommunication and broadcasting: 404 – Public service concession: 407 – Non-discrimination: 409 – Maritime transport: 413 – Air transport: 413 – The Services Directive: 414 – Switzerland: 414 – Secondary law: 415 – Purely internal situations: 415 – Further cases: 416	
C The evolution of interpretive formulas	417
I ‘Broad’	417
1 In the early days: until the mid-1970s	418
Three branches of broad interpretation: 418 – First branch: broad interpretation of notions: 419 – Second branch: narrow exceptions from rules: 420 – Third branch: the greatest possible freedom: 421 – The spin exerted by interpretive formulas: 423	
2 From the mid-1970s until the ‘Maastricht moment’	423
a) First branch: broad notions	423
The first and the second branch connecting: 426 – The first and the third branch connecting: 426 – Lebon expanding Kempf: 427 – Further broad interpretation: 428	
b) Second branch: narrow exceptions from rules	428
The second branch in establishment and services: 429 – Weakness of the second branch in social security: 430	

c)	The third branch: the greatest possible freedom	431
	The third branch's outburst in the mid-1980s: 431 – The	
	third branch's outburst at the beginning of the 1990s: 432 –	
	'Conditions most favourable': 433	
d)	Spin – in the second branch	434
	Spin in the third branch – evolving into empty spin: 434 –	
	Why empty spin?: 435 – Spin in the first branch: 436	
e)	Some conclusions from the period	436
3	During the age of Maastricht	438
a)	First branch: broad notions – 'worker'	438
	Broad free movement of workers: 440 – Broad interpreta-	
	tion in services: 441 – Further broad interpretation: 441 –	
	Connection of the first and third branch: 442 – More broad	
	interpretation: 442 – 'Aim and broad logic': 443 – The con-	
	cept of establishment is 'a very broad one': 444	
b)	Second branch: narrow exceptions from rules – second	
	branch connecting with third	445
	Second branch and recognition: 446 – Derogations: 446 –	
	Second branch in social security: 446 – Second branch in	
	services: 447 – Further derogations: 448 – Second branch	
	connecting with the third in social security, sometimes:	
	448 – Second branch and recognition again: 449 – More	
	derogations: 449 – Second branch and secondary law:	
	450 – Union citizenship implying a particularly restrictive in-	
	terpretation of derogations: 450 – Narrow exception from	
	recognition of driving licences: 451 – Narrow derogation	
	from freedom of maritime services: 452 – Restrictive inter-	
	pretation of the in-house exception: 452 – Derogations	
	again: 452	
c)	Third branch: the greatest possible freedom	453
	Two branches connecting: 453 – 'The most favourable con-	
	ditions': 454 – The greatest possible freedom again: 454	
d)	Spin – and advance statement of case-law	455
	Spin in the first branch: 'worker': 455 – Spin in other parts	
	of the first branch: 456 – Spin in the second branch: 456 –	
	Spin in third branch-combinations: 458 – Spin in the third	
	branch: 458 – Spin at its clearest in third branch: 458 –	
	Empty spin: 459	
e)	Some conclusions from the period	460
4	The present	463
a)	First branch: broad notions – 'worker'	463
	Other broad notions: 464 – Very broad establishment: 466	

b)	Second branch: narrow exceptions from rules	467
	Derogations, connecting with first branch: 467 – Second branch and posted workers: 468 – Further narrow derogations: 468 – Strict interpretation of non-exportability: 469 – Narrow derogations again: 469 – Narrow exceptions from recognition of driving licences: 470 – Exception from the free choice of one’s lawyer: 471 – Derogations, again: 471 – Further second branch interpretation: 472 – Back to derogations: 472 – Second branch in universal service: 473 – Further derogations: 473 – Second branch in secondary law: 475 – More second branch and driving licences: 475 – Narrow student loans: 476	
c)	Third branch: the greatest possible freedom – moving beyond social security	476
	Revival of third branch: 477	
d)	Spin – in the first branch	478
	Spin by very broad establishment: 479 – Spin in the second branch: 480 – Spin and driving licences: 481 – Further spin in the second branch: 481 – Spin in the third branch: 483	
e)	Some conclusions from the present	484
II	‘Coordinated’	489
1	In the early days: until the mid-1970s	489
	The origin of ‘simply coordinated’: 489 – From justifying advantages to distributing powers ...: 490 – ... and back to justifying advantages: 491 – The complexity of coordination: 491 – The shift of Regulation 1408/71: 492 – Spin: 492 – Some conclusions from the period: 493	
2	From the mid-1970s until the ‘Maastricht moment’	494
a)	Occurrence of ‘coordinated’ – ‘simple coordination’ under Regulation 1408/71	494
	Coordination to the disadvantage of migrant workers: 495 – ‘Separate claims’: 495 – Inversing simple coordination: 495 – Simple coordination, in effect a (dis)advantage for migrant workers: 496 – Obfuscation of the origins of ‘simple coordination’: 498 – Further simple coordination cases: 498 – ‘Coordination’ and the ‘stability of the system’: 499 – For and against migrant workers: 499	
b)	Spin	499
	Negative spin: 500 – Empty spin: 501 – More ‘un-empty’ spin: 501	
c)	Some conclusions from the period	501
3	During the age of Maastricht	503

a)	Occurrence of ‘coordinated’ – the beginning of the age 503	503
	Coordination and derived rights: 505 – Six decisions in 1997: 505 – Come-back in 2000: 507 – Two judgments in 2001: 508 – Inverse ‘mere coordination’: 508 – The ‘return’ of ‘complexity’: 509 – Advance statement of case-law: 510	
b)	Spin – and advance statement of case-law 511	511
	The return of empty spin: 512 – Regular spin: 512	
c)	Some conclusions from the period 513	513
4	The present 514	514
a)	Occurrence of ‘coordinated’ – frequent use 514	514
	Absence of harmonisation as a proxy: 515 – ‘Coordination’ v. free movement: 515 – No guarantee of neutrality: 516 – ‘Coordination’ under medical services: 516 – Advance statement: 517 – ‘No neutrality’ and ‘coordination’, again: 518 – The latest cases: 519	
b)	Spin 520	520
	Empty spin: 521 – Advance statement cancelling out spin: 522 – Compliance with the Treaty freedoms obscuring spin: 522	
c)	Some conclusions from the period 522	522
III	‘Fundamental’ 524	524
1	Previously existing ‘fundamental’ notions 524	524
	The ‘fundamental’ freedoms and non-discrimination: 524 – ‘Fundamental’ rights: 527 – ‘Fundamental interests of society’ and other ‘fundamental’ notions: 528 – Conclusions: 530	
2	The ‘status’, linking to Union citizenship 530	530
	The origins: the ‘Community national’ ...: 530 – ... And the ‘Community citizen’: 531 – The parties/national courts driving the ‘Community national’: 531 – The ‘Community national’ becoming current: 533 – Three decades of ‘Community nationality’ – and more: 534 – The end of the ‘Community national’: 535 – Conclusions: 535	
3	The evolution of the ‘fundamental status’ 536	536
a)	Occurrence – in the 2000s 536	536
	Occurrence in the early 2010s: 538 – The blessings of the ‘fundamental status’: 539	
b)	Spin 540	540
	Empty spin: 542 – No spin, advance statement: 542 – Spin uncertain: 543	
c)	Conclusions 544	544
4	Counterfactual evidence 544	544
	Before Grzelczyk: 544 – After Grzelczyk, non-occurrence in the 2000s: 545 – Non-occurrence in the early 2010s: 547 – No non-spin, the blessings of the absence of ‘fundamental sta-	

tus': 548 – The curse of the absence of 'fundamental status':
549 – Conclusions: 550

D Conclusion 551

- I Spin and emptiness 551
- II Breadth 553
- III Coordination 554
- IV Fundamentality 555

E Table of Cases 557

F Bibliography 601

G Acknowledgments 605

