Kölner Schriften zum Friedenssicherungsrecht

23

Benjamin K. Nußberger

Interstate Assistance to the Use of Force



Nomos



Kölner Schriften zum Friedenssicherungsrecht
Cologne Studies on International Peace und Security Law Études colognaises sur le droit de la paix et de la sécurité internationales
Herausgegeben von/Edited by/Éditées par
Prof. Dr. Dr. h.c. Dr. h.c. Claus Kreß LL.M. (Cambridge)
Band/Volume 23

Benjamin K. Nußberger Interstate Assistance to the Use of Force **Nomos** INSTITUTE FOR INTERNATIONAL PEACE

AND SECURITY LAW

The open access publication of this title was made possible by the umbrella initiative "Hochschule.digital Niedersachsen" of the German state of Lower Saxony.

The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data are available on the Internet at http://dnb.d-nb.de

a.t.: Köln, Univ., Diss., 2022

ISBN 978-3-7560-0648-9 (Print)

978-3-7489-3982-5 (ePDF)

British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-3-7560-0648-9 (Print)

978-3-7489-3982-5 (ePDF)

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Nußberger, Benjamin K. Interstate Assistance to the Use of Force Benjamin K. Nußberger 884 pp.

Includes bibliographic references.

ISBN 978-3-7560-0648-9 (Print) 978-3-7489-3982-5 (ePDF)

1st Edition 2023

© Benjamin K. Nußberger

Published by

Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft mbH & Co. KG Waldseestraße 3–5 | 76530 Baden-Baden www.nomos.de

Production of the printed version: Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft mbH & Co. KG Waldseestraße 3–5 | 76530 Baden-Baden

ISBN 978-3-7560-0648-9 (Print) ISBN 978-3-7489-3982-5 (ePDF)

DOI https://doi.org/10.5771/9783748939825



Onlineversion Nomos eLibrary



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License.

To Felicitas and Ferdinand in hope for a peaceful life

Preface

It was a brief letter that ultimately led to this book: Germany's report to the Security Council about its contributions to fighting ISIS in Syria. The masterful ambiguity of the letter intrigued me to explore the legal grey area in which interstate assistance often operates. The manuscript essentially developed during my time at the Institute for International Peace and Security Law at University of Cologne and at the University of Oxford. I defended it as doctoral dissertation at the Faculty of Law of the University of Cologne in November 2022. The present book is a revised and updated version of my dissertation. It takes into account State practice and literature up to March 2023, including practice relating to the ongoing war triggered by the Russian aggression against Ukraine.

A book on assistance, how could it be different, could not have been finished without the support of many. Hence, first and foremost, I would like to extend my sincere gratitude to Professor Claus Kreß, who exemplifies why in Germany a doctoral supervisor is called "Doktorvater" (doctoral father). Claus has been a "Doktorvater" to me in a literal meaning, caring about my academic and personal well-being. I would also like to thank Professor Stefan Hobe as the second examiner of my thesis for reviewing my work so swiftly.

I am grateful for having been able to think, research, and write in extraordinarily stimulating and supportive environments. I would like to especially thank Professor Catherine Redgwell, Professor Dapo Akande, Professor Miles Jackson, and Professor Antonios Tzanakopoulos for their hospitality and for fully integrating me into the vibrant and inspiring PIL group during my two-year academic stay in Oxford. Also, I owe thanks to the Bodleian law library staff, who guided me through the thicket of the archives of United Nations Official Papers. Similarly, I am particularly grateful to have been a fortunate member of the Institute of International Peace and Security Law in Cologne. The institute has always been my academic family and home base. On that note, I wish to thank all my (academic) companions and friends who accompanied me on this journey, emotionally or intellectually. Treading this path together has decisively shaped the book. Each and every conversation about assistance helped me to better understand my questions, my thoughts, and eventually my book

project. Paula Fischer, Josef Weinzierl, and my brother Malte Nußberger, who were the first to take on my full manuscript, deserve special mention here.

I am grateful to the German Academic Scholarship Foundation that generously supported my doctoral studies and my research stay in Oxford; to the German Academic Exchange Service (DAAD) for also supporting my academic visit to Oxford; and to the Institute for International Peace and Security Law as well as the Niedersachsen Consortium for generously funding the publication and enabling me to share my book with all, open access.

Last but not least, I would also like to say 'thank you' to my family – especially Angelika and Stephan, my parents, whose contributions by their very nature could not but be described inadequately, yet in any case have been at any time pivotal. Finally, a great and heartfelt 'merci infiniment' to my wife, Anne-Marie, who personifies loving, boundless, patient, assuring, and enabling assistance that cannot be properly put into words but certainly makes her an 'accomplice' in whatever I do.

Berlin, March 2023

Overview of contents

Chapter 1	Interstate Assistance to the Use of Force – The Framework of the Book	29
Chapter 2	Pre-1945 History of Interstate Assistance – Diversity in Transition	65
Chapter 3	The United Nations Charter and Interstate Assistance	109
Chapter 4	Interstate Assistance in International Practice – Filling the United Nations Charter with Life	183
	The Regulatory Framework Governing Interstate Assistance as Elucidated by International Practice	723
Chapter 6	General Rules of International Law and Interstate Assistance	789
Chapter 7	The Regime Governing Interstate Assistance to the Use of Force – Quo Vadis?	839
Bibliograp	phy	843

Table of contents

Selected Abbre	viations	25
	rstate Assistance to the Use of Force – The nework of the Book	29
I. The in	nportance and relevance to assess interstate	
	nce to a use of force	31
II. The fa	ctual and legal scope of the analysis	43
A. De	finition of 'interstate assistance to the use of force'	44
1)	Action and inaction capable of contributing	45
2)	'Inter-State' assistance	48
3)	Assistance 'short of armed force'	52
4)	Assistance to 'another State's use of force'	54
B. The	e normative focus: universal prohibition(s) to	
cor	ntribute to a use of force	56
III. The o	utline of the book	62
	1945 History of Interstate Assistance – Diversity in	65
I Acciete	ance and the ius ad bellum	65
	ance and the emerging ius contra bellum	69
	sistance and collective security – the Covenant of the	0,
	ague of Nations	70
1)		71
,	a) The ideal concept of a collective security systemb) The role of non-assistance in a collective security	71
	system	76
	c) Families of collective security systems	78
2)	• •	
,	Nations	80
B. Pro	phibitions of war: also prohibitions of assistance to	
wai		89
1)	(Bilateral) treaties of non-aggression and assistance	9(
2)		97

III. Assistance in a time of transition	106
Chapter 3 The United Nations Charter and Interstate Assistance	109
I. The <i>ius contra bellum</i> under the UN Charter and interstate assistance: an overview	109
II. A prohibition of assistance by a UN sanction – Article 41	
UN Charter	111
A. Sanctions as non-assistance obligations? The scope and content of sanctions	112
B. The precondition for sanctions	112 113
C. Non-automatic sanctions: the role of the Security	113
Council	114
D. UN sanctions as the exclusive regime governing	
assistance?	117
III. Article 2(5) UN Charter: non-assistance only if the United	
Nations takes action?	119
A. The trigger: A general prohibition of interstate	
assistance?	120
B. The scope: A prohibition of assistance to conduct	122
obstructing UN action C. Is Article 2(5) alt 2 UN Charter exclusive?	122
D. Article 2(5) UN Charter as embodiment of a general	123
idea	126
IV. An implicit prohibition of assistance in view of specifically	
recognized rights to provide assistance?	127
A. Is assistance permissible only to a use of force through	
the United Nations?	128
B. Is assistance permissible in collective self-defense only?	130
C. Some observations	134
V. Obligatory solidarity under the UN Charter?	135
VI. Assistance as a prohibited threat or use of force? – Article	126
2(4) UN Charter A. An act of assistance to a use of force as 'force'?	136 138
Dogmatic distinction between assisting and assisted	136
conduct	138
2) The contribution of assistance to a use of force as	100
'force'?	139
3) The risk created by assistance as 'force'?	142

	4)	Terminological clarification	145
	В. Ар	rohibition of assistance as necessary and logical	
	cor	inplement to the agreement to refrain from a use force	
	itse	elf?	149
	C. Ass	sistance as a 'use' of force?	153
	1)	No limitation of Article 2(4) UN Charter to 'direct	
		use'	154
		a) 'Indirect use' - 'use' through interstate	
		assistance?	156
		b) Proposals to define 'indirect use of force'	160
	2)	Article 2(4) UN Charter's guidance on assistance	163
		a) An actual conduct that meets the threshold of	
		use or threat of force	163
		b) The necessary degree of involvement	164
		sistance as a 'threat' of force?	165
VII.		ance and sovereign equality under Article 2(1) UN	
	Charte		166
	A. Ass	sistance as unlawful intervention in internal affairs of	
		target State?	167
	1)	Can assistance bear on internal affairs of another	
		State?	169
	2)	Assistance as coercion?	170
		a) Assistance as direct intervention	171
		b) Assistance as indirect intervention	173
		sistance and the prohibition to infringe upon	
		ritorial sovereignty	174
		written prohibition of participation in a use of force?	175
IX.		N Charter – Not comprehensive, but guidance for	
	intern	ational practice	181
C1 (4 T 4		
Cnapter		rstate Assistance in International Practice – Filling United Nations Charter with Life	102
	the t	Sinted Nations Charter with Life	183
I.	Metho	odological approach	183
II.	Assista	ance in international practice	187
	A. Ass	sistance in abstract international practice	188
	1)	The ILC Draft Declaration on Rights and Duties of	
		States (1949)	190
		a) The nature of the Draft Declaration	192

	b) The Draft Declaration – an overview	194
	c) 'Intervention' and assistance	197
	d) Article 10 of the Draft Declaration	203
	(1) Article 19 Panama Draft	203
	(2) Discussions within the ILC	206
	(3) The status of Article 10 of the Draft	
	Declaration	211
	(4) The scope of the prohibitions in Article 10 of	
	the Draft Declaration	214
	e) The relevance of the Draft Declaration for	
	assistance	217
2)	The Friendly Relations Declaration (1970)	218
	a) Assistance in the framework of discussions	220
	b) Assistance and the negotiations	222
	c) Assistance and the prohibition to use force	225
	(1) The debate on assistance to non-State actors	225
	(a) Application to States?	226
	(b) Structural elements of the prohibition of	
	indirect use of force	230
	(2) Assistance as 'force'	239
	d) Assistance and intervention	240
	e) Assistance as a threat of force	241
3)	The Definition of Aggression (1974)	242
	a) Nature and purpose of the Definition	243
	b) The Definition of Aggression and assistance	247
	c) Assistance in the early debates on aggression	248
	(1) Debates when drafting the UN Charter	248
	(2) The UNGA debates in the First Committee	249
	(3) The ILC debate	251
	(a) The report of the special rapporteur	251
	(b) The debate within the ILC	253
	(c) States' reactions	254
	(4) The UN Secretary General report 1952	256
	d) Assistance in the era of Special Committees	257
	(1) The first two Special Committees	257
	(a) The 1953 Committee	258
	(b) The 1956 Committee	261
	(c) The 1957 Committee	262

	(d) Some observations	264
	(2) The Third Special Committee – Interstate	
	assistance as free rider	264
	(a) 1967-1969	265
	(b) 1969-1970	268
	(c) 1971	273
	(d) 1972	275
	(e) 1973	276
	(i) Some observations	277
	(ii) States' observations	285
	(f) 1974	287
	(i) The degree of involvement	289
	(ii) 'Its territory'	294
	e) The concept: Assistance as aggression	295
ł)	The Declaration on the Enhancement of the	
	Effectiveness of the Principle of Refraining from the	
	Use of Force in International Relations (1987)	302
	a) A controversial and conservative resolution	303
	b) A relevant resolution – particularly for non-	
	assistance	307
	c) Assistance in the proposals	308
	d) Assistance in the debates	312
	(1) Indirect use of force	313
	(a) No broad understanding of 'force'	315
	(b) An assisted act that involves the threat or	
	use of force as precondition	315
	(c) Application to interstate assistance?	319
	(i) A prohibition of perpetration	319
	(ii) applicable in the interstate	
	context	320
	(iii) but applied to non-State actors	
	only	322
	(d) Conclusion	324
	(2) The separate prohibition of participation	324
	(a) Uncontroversial	324
	(b) and not new	326
	(c) but still welcome	328
	(d) The substantiation of the prohibition	329

		(e) The relationship with other rules	332
		(f) A prohibition of participation	333
		e) Nothing new, but more clarity	337
		f) A duty to provide assistance to the victim?	339
	5)	The Articles on State Responsibility	340
	,	a) The evolution of Article 16 ARS as proof of a	
		pre-existing special rule governing assistance in	
		the ius contra bellum	34
		b) Article 16 ARS applied to the use of force	344
	6)	Selection of abstract views of individual States on	
		assistance	344
		a) The Tripartite Declaration	345
		b) USA	345
		c) Germany	347
В.	Ass	sistance in treaty practice	349
	1)	Treaties regulating assistance	350
		a) Assistance as prohibited 'use of force' or	
		'aggression'	354
		b) A separate prohibition: non-assistance to a use of	
		force or aggression	358
		c) Treaties' indication for the general framework of	
		assistance	368
	2)	Treaties by which States provide assistance	369
		a) Treaties of solidarity	370
		b) Treaties of general military cooperation and	
		security assistance	374
		c) Treaties establishing military bases	379
		d) Permissions of transit	383
		(1) Transit through water	383
		(2) Overflight	385
		(3) Territorial passage	386
		e) Preliminary observations	386
	3)	The Arms Trade Treaty	387
C.	Ass	sistance in conflict practice	392
	1)	The Korea war 1950	395
		a) Assistance to South Korea and the US-led	
		military operation	396
		b) (Non-)Assistance to North Korea	403

2)	The Suez crisis 1956	408	
3)	American and British intervention in Lebanon and		
	Jordan 1958	408	
4)	The U2 incident 1960	410	
5)	Stanleyville 1964	413	
6)	US operations in Cambodia against North Vietnam		
	1970	416	
7)	The rescue operation in Entebbe 1976	417	
8)	The Osirak incident 1981	421	
9)	The Falklands/Malvinas conflict 1982	427	
10)	The Iraq-Iran conflict 1980-1988	430	
11)	Operation El Dorado Canyon in Libya 1986	434	
12)	The Chadian-Libyan conflict 1987	439	
13)	No-flight zones in Iraq 1991-2003	440	
	a) Iraq	442	
	b) Assisting States	444	
14)	US strikes in Afghanistan 1998	449	
15)	Operation Iraqi Freedom 2003		
	a) The role of assistance in Iraq: the US 'coalition'		
	narrative	452	
	b) Assistance to the use of force or occupation	454	
	(1) States engaged in combat	454	
	(2) States deploying troops to assist	454	
	(3) States refraining from assistance	457	
	(4) Regional States	459	
	(a) Declarations of non-assistance	459	
	(b) not implemented in practice?	462	
	(c) A special case: Kuwait	464	
	(5) States providing assistance	467	
	(6) Political assistance	475	
	c) Assistance, but not to the use of force or		
	occupation?	476	
	(1) Assistance in the preparation stage	476	
	(2) Humanitarian assistance	477	
	(3) Assistance to reconstruction – assistance to		
	occupation?	477	
	(4) NATO involvement: assistance to Turkey		
	and Poland, but not more	480	

	d)	Protest against assistance	481
	e)	Assistance to Iraq	484
	f)	Some general observations	484
16)	Th	e Georgian-Russian war 2008	487
17)	Th	e Abu Kamal raid 2008	492
18)	Th	e intervention in Libya 2011	494
	a)	States engaged in combat and providing	
		assistance	496
	b)	States providing assistance	504
	c)	Non-Supporting States	507
	d)	Conclusion	508
19)	Th	e war in Yemen since 2015	509
	a)	Operations Decisive Storm and Restoring Hope	509
		(1) The Coalition using force	509
		(2) States providing support short of direct use	
		of force	510
		(a) United States	510
		(b) United Kingdom	516
		(c) African States	519
		(d) States licensing arms export	522
	b)	Attacks directed against Saudi-Arabia	525
20)	Fig	ghting ISIS in Iraq and Syria since 2014	526
	a)	Assistance to airstrikes in Iraq in the realm of the	
		'Global Coalition'	527
	b)	Assistance to airstrikes in Syria in the realm of	
		the 'Global Coalition'	529
		(1) States eventually conducting air strikes in	
		Syria	532
		(a) Australia	532
		(b) Regional (Arab) States	536
		(c) Canada	536
		(d) United Kingdom	538
		(e) France	543
		(f) Netherlands	544
		(g) Turkey	545
		(h) Denmark	547
		(2) States providing assistance only	549
		(a) Iraq	550

			(b) Germany	551
			(c) Italy	556
			(d) Poland	558
			(e) Spain	558
			(f) Greece	559
			(g) Sweden	560
			(h) European States "unburdening France"	561
			(i) Singapore	562
			(j) Coalition States without making	
			contributions: the example of Panama	562
		(3)	Protest against Assistance?	563
	c)	Ass	isting assistance to Syrian opposition forces	563
	d)	Ass	istance to Russia for its operations in Syria	566
21)	Fig	htin	ng ISIS in Libya 2015 and 2016	568
22)	Str	ikes	in reaction to use of chemical weapons 2017	
	an	d 20	18	570
23)	Th	e So	leimani incident 2020	571
24)	Th	e wa	ar in Ukraine since 2022	575
	a)	Ass	istance and Russia's military operation	577
		(1)	Belarus	577
		(2)	Syria	590
		(3)	China	591
		(4)	Iran	595
			Western (non)-sanctions	597
	b)		istance and Ukraine's defense	598
			Western States' military assistance	599
			Reactions to Western assistance	610
			airstrikes in Syria against Iran	615
26)			nce and Turkey's military operations against	
			h groups	620
	-		rmany	620
	,	US		623
			e Arab League	626
27)			nce and drone strikes	626
			ited Kingdom's contributions	627
			bouti and Camp Lemonnier and Chabelley	628
			e Netherlands and intelligence	628
	d)	Ital	v and the base in Sigonella	629

		e) Germany and the Ramstein base	630
		(1) German government's position	631
		(2) German courts	634
D.	Ass	sistance and the International Court of Justice	638
	1)	The Corfu Channel Case	639
	2)	The Case concerning Military and Paramilitary	
		Activities in and against Nicaragua	645
		a) Factual assumptions of the Court	646
		b) Overview of the Court's legal framework on	
		assistance	648
		c) Assistance and the prohibition against threat and	
		use of force	648
		(1) Direct use of force	649
		(2) Indirect use of force	649
		(a) The Court's conceptualization of	
		indirect use of force	650
		(b) Necessary involvement for indirect 'use'	651
		(c) Consequences – self-defense against	
		assistance	658
		(3) Assistance as a threat of force	659
		d) Assistance and the principle of non-intervention	660
		e) Assistance, sovereignty and territorial	
		inviolability	664
	3)	The Legality of the Use of Force Cases	665
	4)	The Oil Platforms Case	666
	5)	The Armed Activities on the Territory of the Congo	
		Case	670
		a) Assistance and the use of force	675
		(1) Sudanese involvement	678
		(2) Uganda and the Kitona attacks	681
		b) Assistance and self-defense	682
	6)	The Bosnia Genocide Case	684
Ε.	Per	missible assistance under the UN Charter	685
	1)	'Assistance' in Article 43 UN Charter	686
	2)	The Security Council's understanding of assistance	
		to an authorized force	689
	3)	Article 51 UN Charter – assistance in collective self-	
		defense	692

F. Assistance in case the UN takes ac	tion 692
1) Non-assistance as UN enforce	ment measure 693
a) Authorization of a use of fo	orce – an implicit
prohibition to provide assis	stance to the targeted
State (when) using force?	693
b) Sanctions with respect to in	nterstate use of force 696
(1) Sanction against the as	
prohibition of interstat	
(2) Sanction against the as	
prohibition of interstat	te assistance to a use of
force	698
c) UN non-binding calls for n	non-assistance 706
(1) Practice of the Security	
(2) Practice of the General	l Assembly 707
2) International practice relating	to Article 2(5) UNC 708
a) General observations: appl	lication if the UN
takes action	710
b) A duty to assist the UN	712
c) Non-assistance to the targe	et State 716
(1) UN measures short of	force 717
(2) Measures involving the	e use of force 719
d) Preliminary observations	719
Chapter 5 The Regulatory Framework Govern	ning Interctate
Assistance as Elucidated by Interna	•
·	
I. Regulation of interstate assistance wit	
duality in practice	728
A. The distinguishing criteria in the a	•
remoteness	729
 Distinguishing factors 	731
a) Assistance – how?	731
(1) Assistance – what is pr	ovided? The objective
criteria	732
(2) The implication of assi	
force	733
(3) The subjective attitude	of the assisting State 733

		b)	Key features in application of the distinguishing	
		,	criteria	734
			(1) Assistance – to whom? The assisted actor	734
			(a) Nature of the assisted actor: State or	
			non-State	735
			(b) The role of the recipient within the	
			assisted actor?	737
			(2) Assistance – a quid pro quo?	738
	2)	Re	levance of other legal concepts?	738
В.	Wh		interstate assistance is prohibited how?	741
	1)		sistance under the prohibition to use of force	742
			Direct use of (own) force	742
		b)	Indirect use of force	743
			(1) Assisted use of force by a State	744
			(2) The assisted use of force	744
			(3) The relationship between the act of	
			assistance and the assisted use of force	746
			(4) Legal consequences	749
		c)	A flexible interpretation within the UN Charter's	
			boundaries	751
	2)	As	sistance under a prohibition of participation in an	
		un	lawful use of force	753
			Existence of the prohibition of participation	754
		b)	Contours and scope of the prohibition of	
			participation	755
			(1) Dependency on the occurrence of another	
			State's use of force	755
			(2) Qualification of the assisted use of force	756
			(3) The relationship between assistance and use	
			of force	758
			(a) Assistance through omissions	759
			(b) Objective factors	760
			(c) Subjective factors	762
			(d) Intention	766
			(4) Legal consequences	768
			(a) Is participation only justified when the	
			assisting State would have a right to use	
			force?	770

(i) Participation due to necessity?	770
(ii) Participation as a countermeasure?	773
(b) Self-defense and international criminal	
responsibility	774
(c) Relationship with duties to cooperate	
and assist	775
c) A 'modifying' change of the UN Charter's	
paradigm?	776
3) Norms that are not applied to interstate assistance to	
a use of force	778
a) Prohibition of a threat of force	778
b) The non-intervention rule and assistance	780
c) The territorial inviolability and assistance	782
d) A general duty to ensure respect for the	
prohibition to use force under the UN Charter?	783
II. Regulation of interstate assistance dependent on UN action	783
A. Sanctions prohibit assistance	784
B. Interaction of the UN and general rules on assistance	787
C. Article 2(5) UN Charter	787
Chapter 6 General Rules of International Law and Interstate Assistance	789
I. Assistance and the attribution of conduct	789
A. Assistance and Articles 4, 8, 11 ARS	792
B. Joint conduct: attribution of conduct by virtue of co-	
perpetration?	794
 Joint conduct as attribution of conduct? 	795
2) Assistance as 'joint conduct'?	798
C. Special attribution grounds in <i>ius contra bellum</i> ?	800
II. Assistance leading to 'international responsibility' in	
connection with the act of another State	802
A. Article 16 ARS – "aid and assistance"	802
1) The legal result of assistance: "internationally	
responsible"	803
2) Preconditions for prohibited assistance under	
Article 16 ARS	810
a) The requirement of an unlawful assisted act	810

Table of contents

b) The objective condition: 'aid and assistance in	
the commission of an internationally wrongful	
act'	812
c) The subjective prerequisites: Article 16 (a) ARS	816
(1) Knowledge of the circumstances of the	
internationally wrongful act	816
(2) Intention to facilitate?	820
(3) Knowledge at what point in time?	821
d) The opposability requirement: Article 16 (b)	
ARS	821
e) A different threshold for assistance to serious	
breaches of peremptory norms?	823
3) Relationship to specific rules governing assistance	826
B. Assistance as 'direction and control' or 'coercion'	829
III. Assistance and due diligence obligations	831
A. Due diligence obligations informing non-assistance	
provisions	832
B. Due diligence obligations requiring non-assistance	833
Chapter 7 The Regime Governing Interstate Assistance to the Use	0.26
of Force – Quo Vadis?	839
Bibliography	843
3101108144117	010

Selected Abbreviations

1987- United Nations General Assembly Resolution 42/22 of 18 Novem-

Declaration ber 1987, Declaration on the Enhancement of the Effectiveness of

the Principle of Refraining from the Use of Force in International

Relations

Aggression United Nations General Assembly Resolution 3314 (XXIX) of 14

Definition December 1974, Definition of Aggression

alt alternative

AP Associated Press
Appl No Application Number

ARIO Articles on the Responsibility of International Organizations, in

Yearbook of the International Law Commission, 2011, vol. II, Part Two, as it appears in the annex to General Assembly resolution

66/100 of 27 February 2012

ARS Articles on the Responsibility of States for Internationally Wrongful

Acts, Yearbook of the International Law Commission, 2001, vol II (Part Two), as it appears in the annex to General Assembly resolution 56/83 of 12 December 2001, and corrected by document

A/56/49(Vol. I)/Corr.4.

ASEAN Association of Southeast Asian Nations

ATT Arms Trade Treaty, adopted by United Nations General Assembly

Resolution 67/234B of 2 April 2013, entered into force 24 December

2014, 3013 UNTS I52373

AU African Union

BT Drs Bundestagsdrucksache
BVerfG Bundesverfassungsgericht

BVerfGE Entscheidungen des Bundesverfassungsgerichts

BVerwG Bundesverwaltungsgericht

BVerwGE Entscheidungen des Bundesverwaltungsgerichts

CADSP Solemn Declaration on a Common African Defense and Security

Policy (27-28 February 2004)

Daesh Islamic State of Iraq and the Levant

Deb Debate

DeptStBull Department of State Bulletin

Selected Abbreviations

DW Deutsche Welle

ECHR European Convention of Human Rights **ECOWAS Economic Community of West African States**

ECtHR European Court of Human Rights

ed Editor edn edition eds Editors

EU European Union

FAZFrankfurter Allgemeine Zeitung

Friendly United Nations General Assembly Resolution 2625 (XXV) of 24 Relations October 1970, Declaration on Principles of International Law con-Declaration cerning Friendly Relations and Cooperation among States in ac-

cordance with the Charter of the United Nations

FT Financial Times

GCC Gulf Cooperation Council

HCHouse of Commons HI. House of Lords

i.a. inter alia

IBTimes International Business Times ICC International Criminal Court

ICCPR International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, adopted and

> opened for signature, ratification and accession by United Nations General Assembly resolution 2200A (XXI) of 16 December 1966,

entered into force 23 March 1976, 999 UNTS 171

ICG International Crisis Group ICI International Court of Justice

ICRC International Committee of the Red Cross

ICTY International Criminal Tribunal of the Yugoslavia

IHL International Humanitarian Law ILC International Law Commission

ILC ARS Responsibility of States for Internationally Wrongful Acts, General Commentary Commentary, as it appears in Yearbook of the International Law Commission, 2001 vol II Part Two as corrected, pages 31-143

Yearbook of the International Law Commission **ILCYB**

ILDC International Law in Domestic Courts ILM International Legal Materials
IRNA Islamic Republic News Agency
ISIL Islamic State of Iraq and the Levant
ISIS Islamic State of Iraq and the Levant

KUNA Kuwait News Agency

LNTS League of Nations Treaty Series

LoN League of Nations

LoNC Covenant of the League of Nations

NAM Non-Aligned Movement

NATO North Atlantic Treaty Organization

No Number

NYT New York Times

OAS Organization of American States

OSCE Organization for Security and Co-Operation in Europe

OIC Organisation of Islamic Cooperation

OVG Oberverwaltungsgericht

para paragraph

RFERL Radio Free Europe Radio Liberty

SIPRI Stockholm International Peace Research Institute

SOFA Status of Force Agreement

SZ Süddeutsche Zeitung

TIAS Treaties and Other International Acts Series

UN United Nations

UNC Charter of the United Nations

UNCIO Documents of the United Nations Conference on International

Organization

UNGA United Nations General Assembly

UNRIAA Reports of International Arbitration Awards

UNSC United Nations Security Council
UNSG United Nations Secretary General
UNTS United Nations Treaty Series
UNYB Yearbook of the United Nations

UST United States Treaties and Other International Agreements

Selected Abbreviations

VCLT Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties, done on 23 May 1969,

entered into force on 27 January 1980, 1155 UNTS 331

VG Verwaltungsgericht

vol volume

WaPo Washington Post WSJ Wall Street Journal

Symbols without specific designation are United Nations documents. For the abbreviations used, see the Dag Hammarskjöld United Nations Library guide on 'UN Document Symbols' available at: https://research.un.org/en/docs/symbols.