

Kevin Li


Reconceiving Extraterritorial Jurisdiction

From Formality to Function



Nomos

<https://doi.org/10.5771/9783748933212-1>, am 05.08.2024, 05:36:27

Open Access –  – <https://www.nomos-elibrary.de/agb>

Beiträge zum
ausländischen öffentlichen Recht und Völkerrecht

Edited by

the Max Planck Society
for the Advancement of Science
represented by Prof. Dr. Armin von Bogdandy
and Prof. Dr. Anne Peters

Volume 313

Kevin Li

Reconceiving Extraterritorial Jurisdiction

From Formality to Function



Nomos

Gefördert durch die Deutsche Forschungsgemeinschaft (DFG) – 499582385
funded by the Deutsche Forschungsgemeinschaft (DFG, German Research Foundation)
– 499582385

The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data are available on the Internet at <http://dnb.d-nb.de>

a.t.: München, Univ., Diss., 2020

ISBN 978-3-8487-8984-9 (Print)
978-3-7489-3321-2 (ePDF)

British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-3-8487-8984-9 (Print)
978-3-7489-3321-2 (ePDF)

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Li, Kevin

Reconceiving Extraterritorial Jurisdiction
From Formality to Function

Kevin Li

368 pp.

Includes bibliographic references.

ISBN 978-3-8487-8984-9 (Print)
978-3-7489-3321-2 (ePDF)

1st Edition 2022

© Kevin Li

Published by

Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft mbH & Co. KG
Waldseestraße 3–5 | 76530 Baden-Baden
www.nomos.de

Production of the printed version:

Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft mbH & Co. KG
Waldseestraße 3–5 | 76530 Baden-Baden

ISBN 978-3-8487-8984-9 (Print)
ISBN 978-3-7489-3321-2 (ePDF)

DOI <https://doi.org/10.5771/9783748933212>



Onlineversion
Nomos eLibrary



This work is licensed under the Creative Commons Attribution
4.0 International License.

Preface

The present thesis was accepted as inaugural dissertation at the Faculty of Law of LMU Munich on 8 December 2020. With the permission of the Faculty, parts of this thesis were slightly abridged and updated prior to publication.

A doctoral thesis is never written alone. Of all the people who accompanied me on this long journey, I am most grateful to my doctoral supervisor Professor Christian Walter: Not only did he inspire and encourage me to pursue this work in the first place, but he also offered invaluable, timely and kind support during the research and writing of this thesis. Most importantly, he was always open to listen to my struggles and ideas and in turn responded with profound criticism and thoughtful advice.

I also wish to thank Professor Martin Burgi for providing a speedy and favourable second examiner's report. Further, I am indebted to Professor Jens Kersten for serving as examiner during a particularly lively oral examination.

Many of the ideas and inspirations contained in this work are the fruits of discussions at the LMU Chair of Public International Law and Public Law and for that I would like to express my gratitude to my colleagues at the Chair. At various times, I worked with, among others, Maria Monnheimer, Stefan Herrmann, Markus Vordermayer-Riemer, Stefan Schäferling, Charlotte Mölter, Cathrine Crämer and Philip Nedelcu. Thanks are also due to the other academic and administrative staff at the Faculty of Law with whom I had the pleasure of working with over the years.

Furthermore, I wish to thank Professor Anne Peters and Professor Armin von Bogdandy of the Max Planck Institute for Comparative Public Law and International Law for including this work into the book series 'Contributions on Comparative Public Law and International Law'. I couldn't have asked for a more appropriate place to publish this thesis.

This research has been generously supported by the *Stiftung der Deutschen Wirtschaft* (sdw, Foundation of German Business). The publication is funded by the *Deutsche Forschungsgemeinschaft* (DFG, German Research Foundation). I am grateful for the support provided by both organisations. I also wish to thank the anonymous reviewer for the

Preface

Deutsche Forschungsgemeinschaft, who offered constructive comments and suggestions.

I am deeply grateful to my parents and my brother Enno who have continuously encouraged and supported me in this endeavour.

But above all, Nicole: This work has been a journey for me as much as it has been for you and if I have learned one thing during this time, then it is that you are an infinitely better person than me. Nothing that I could write here would do justice to your patience, trust and sacrifice. Thank you.

Spring 2022

Kevin Li

Inhaltsverzeichnis

A. Introduction	13
I. Purpose and Scope of the Study	13
II. Structure of the Argument	17
III. Concepts and Definitions	20
1. State Jurisdiction and State Sovereignty	20
2. Extraterritoriality and Extraterritorial Jurisdiction	22
3. The Concept of Jurisdiction in International Human Rights Treaties	24
4. Categories of State Jurisdiction	26
5. Regulation, Public Law and Jurisdiction	29
B. Prescriptive Jurisdiction in Public International Law	32
I. General Approaches	32
1. The Case of the S.S. Lotus	32
2. The Permissive Principles Approach under Customary International Law	34
a) Territoriality	35
aa) The Territoriality Principle and Cross-border Criminal Offenses	36
bb) The US Presumption against Extraterritoriality	37
b) The Effects Principle	38
aa) The Effects Principle in Competition Law	39
bb) The Effects Principle in Other Areas of Substantive Law	43
c) Active Personality	45
d) Passive Personality	47
e) The Protective Principle	48
f) The Universality Principle	50
3. Treaty-based Extensions of Jurisdiction	54
4. Territoriality-based Jurisdiction and the Internet	56
II. Principles Restraining the Exercise of Jurisdiction	61
1. Limitations according to General Principles in International Law	63
a) Genuine Link	63

b) Abuse of Rights	64
c) Proportionality	66
2. Comity	68
3. Reasonableness	70
C. Case Studies	74
I. Focus and Structure	74
II. Economic Sanctions	76
1. Introduction	76
a) Economic Sanctions under International Law	78
b) Primary and Secondary Sanctions	81
c) Overview of US Economic Sanctions	82
aa) US Sanctions against Cuba	84
bb) US Sanctions against Iran	84
cc) US Sanctions against Russia	86
2. The Extension of Personality-based Jurisdiction to Foreign Subsidiaries	87
a) Practice in the United States	87
b) Practice in Europe	90
aa) The Personal Scope of EU Restrictive Measures	90
bb) Diplomatic Protest against US Assertions of Control-based Jurisdiction	91
cc) Jurisprudence with regard to US Assertions of Control-based Jurisdiction	94
c) Comparative Normative Analysis	96
3. Territoriality and US Dollar Transactions by non-US Financial Institutions	100
a) Practice in the United States	100
b) Practice in Europe	104
c) Comparative Normative Analysis	107
4. Secondary Trade Boycotts	111
a) Practice in the United States	112
b) Practice in Europe	114
c) Comparative Normative Analysis	117
5. Protection of Individual Rights	122
a) Practice in the United States	124
b) Practice in Europe	125
6. Conclusion	127
III. Non-Proliferation and Export Control	129
1. Introduction	129

2. International Instruments	131
a) International Treaties	132
b) Informal Multilateral Regimes	135
c) Security Council Resolutions	137
3. Jurisdiction Based on the ‘Nationality’ of Goods	139
a) Practice in the United States	139
b) Practice in China	142
c) Practice in Europe	144
d) Comparative Normative Analysis	145
4. Jurisdiction Based on Voluntary Submission	149
a) Practice in the United States	149
b) Practice in Europe	150
c) Comparative Normative Analysis	152
5. Conclusion	154
IV. Anti-Corruption	156
1. Introduction	156
2. Foundations of Transnational Anti-Corruption Regulation	159
3. International Anti-Corruption Instruments	162
a) The Jurisdictional Provisions of the OECD Anti-Bribery Convention	163
b) The Jurisdictional Provisions of the UN Convention Against Corruption	165
4. Regulation through Parent-Subsidiary Relationships	167
a) Practice in the United States	167
aa) The Jurisdictional Scope of the FCPA	168
bb) Parent and Subsidiary Liability Based on the Accounting Provisions	170
cc) Parent and Subsidiary Liability Based on the Agency Theory	172
b) Practice in Europe	175
aa) The UK Bribery Act 2010	175
bb) The French Law Regarding Transparency, the Fight against Corruption and the Modernization of Economic Life	178
c) Comparative Normative Analysis	180
aa) The Assertion of Jurisdiction in respect of Corporate Group Policies	180
bb) The Assertion of Control-based Jurisdiction under the FCPA	182
5. Correspondent Account Jurisdiction under the FCPA	184

6. Jurisdiction based on ‘business presence’	187
a) Practice in the United States	188
b) Practice in Europe	188
aa) The UK Bribery Act 2010	188
bb) The French Law Regarding Transparency, the Fight Against Corruption and the Modernization of Economic Life	190
c) Comparative Normative Analysis	190
7. Conclusion	193
V. Business and Human Rights	197
1. Introduction	197
2. Foundations of Business and Human Rights	200
a) Corporate Social Responsibility and Business and Human Rights	200
b) Historic Development of Business and Human Rights at the International Level	202
c) The UN Guiding Principles	204
3. Extraterritoriality in Business and Human Rights	207
a) Extraterritorial Jurisdiction as a Matter of Permission	207
b) Extraterritorial Jurisdiction as a Matter of Obligation	209
4. Regulation through Parent-Subsidiary or Lead-Supplier Relationships	212
a) Trade, Procurement and Investment Measures	212
aa) Practice in the United States	212
bb) Practice in Europe	214
b) Mandatory Supply Chain Regulation	215
aa) Practice in the United States	216
bb) Practice in Europe	219
c) Disclosure and Transparency Requirements	222
aa) Practice in the United States	222
bb) Practice in Europe	224
d) Comparative Normative Analysis	225
5. Transnational Human Rights Litigation	228
a) Practice in the United States	229
b) Practice in Europe	233
aa) Amicus Curiae Briefs in the Kiobel Proceedings	234
bb) Transnational Human Rights Litigation in Europe	235
c) Comparative Normative Analysis	238
aa) Jurisdiction over Corporations Domiciled in the Forum State	239

bb) Jurisdiction over Corporations Domiciled in Third States	240
6. Conclusion	244
VI. Synthesis: The Deficient Territoriality-based System	247
1. The Normative Inconsistency of Territoriality	248
a) Market Access Regulation Conditioned on Extraterritorial Circumstances	248
b) Parent-based Regulation of Multinational Corporations	252
c) Regulation of Conduct Based on Only Fleeting Territorial Connections or Based on Territorial ‘Presence’	255
2. The Restriction to Considerations of State Sovereignty	257
3. Conclusion	259
D. The Way Forward	260
I. Arguing for a New Approach to Jurisdiction in International Law	261
1. Alternative Approaches to Solve Concurrent Jurisdiction	262
a) Substantive Harmonization	262
b) Cooperation	264
2. The History of the Territoriality Principle	265
3. Extraterritorial Jurisdiction regulated by the Principle of Non-Intervention	267
4. Extraterritorial Jurisdiction as an Exercise of Public Authority	269
II. Theoretical Considerations	271
1. Legitimacy: Democracy and Community Interests	271
a) Territoriality, Nationality and Democracy	273
aa) Territoriality	273
bb) Nationality	275
cc) Conclusion	276
b) Universality and Community Interests	277
c) Proximity, Community Interests and the Rule of Law	280
2. Individual Interests and State Jurisdiction	281
a) The Potential for Individuals to Shape State Jurisdiction	282
b) Individual Fairness as a Principle Restraining the Exercise of Jurisdiction	285
c) Individual Rights Catalysing the Exercise of Jurisdiction	288

3. Conclusion	289
III. A more Desirable Framework	290
1. Practical Requirements and Objectives of the New Framework	291
2. The Variables Determining the Legitimacy of Extraterritorial Jurisdiction	293
a) Proximity and Substantial Connection	293
b) Legitimate Interest and the Subject Matter of Regulation	296
c) The Intrusiveness of the Measure	299
3. The Relationship between the Variables	301
a) The Abuse of Rights Test	302
b) The Proportionality Test	305
aa) True Conflicts	307
bb) False Conflicts	308
4. Procedural Safeguards, Reasoning and Participation	309
5. Application of the Framework in Practice	312
a) Market Access Regulation Conditioned on Extraterritorial Circumstances	312
b) Parent-based Regulation of Multinational Corporations	315
c) Regulation Based on Individual Consent of the Affected	317
6. Pre-empting Some Potential Objections	320
E. Conclusion	325
Deutschsprachige Zusammenfassung	330
A. Einleitung	330
B. Die Regelungshoheit im Völkerrecht	331
C. Fallstudien zur Staatenpraxis	332
D. Ein neuer Ansatz	339
E. Ausblick	341
Table of Cases	343
Bibliography	351