

Nutzer des Buches durchaus von Interesse. So finden sich im Literaturverzeichnis beispielsweise weder Thomas O. Beidelmans Rezension von "The Ritual Process" (*Anthropos* 65.1970: 322–324) noch Rudolf Rahmanns Besprechung von "Image and Pilgrimage in Christian Culture" (*Anthropos* 75.1980: 957–961). Auch Vincent Crapanzanos Kommentar zu "Blazing the Trail" ist dort nicht aufgeführt (*Anthropos* 88.1993: 624–625). Eine Berücksichtigung dieser Rezensionen im Blick auf die Rezeption der Arbeiten Turners wäre aufschlussreich gewesen, da insbesondere Beidelman und Crapanzano in ihren Besprechungen auch Kritik formulieren.

Harald Grauer

**Hoffman, Danny:** *Monrovia Modern. Urban Form and Political Imagination in Liberia.* Durham: Duke University Press, 2017. 205 pp. ISBN 978-0-8223-5884-8. Price: \$ 26.95

Danny Hoffman is one of those scholars who apparently always seem to come up with something new. In his early work, he focused on young men who fought in the Mano River wars, and has continued to follow their fates, challenges, and opportunities after. With a background in photojournalism, he has also combined these studies with visual ethnography, and even experimented with video ethnography. In this brave venture of a book, he combines architecture with lives in Monrovia, focusing on "political imagination and its relationship to the built environment" (xviii).

"Monrovia Modern" attempts to do several things in seven chapters, consisting of "photowriting" of 101 illustrations and Hoffman's trademark enjoyable prose: it discusses the lives of Monrovia ex-combatants and their relation to space; four cases of ruined spaces; and the political ordering through form. After a lengthy introduction that ties together the different strands of the story, the first chapter focuses on the lives of Monrovia ex-combatants. The following four chapters are the real focus of the work, and contain photo essays that focus on four landmark buildings in Monrovia, investigated as examples of urban forms that are employed by political projects to establish order. Yet as always, order enables some things, while curtailing others. Finally, a short conclusion underlines the ultimately sociopolitical nature of form.

The first chapter on ex-combatants is arguably the most controversial one in the book. Although the author takes up the question whether it is justifiable to discuss ex-combatants fifteen years into the post-conflict, he defends this choice by "their continued subjection to global processes that buffet them at every turn and structure their experience of the city just as it did during the war" (184). The generalized use of the term Monrovia ex-combatants nevertheless risks being interpreted as essentialistic and suggests the existence of a community that unites the thousands of people who partook in the war in a manner that appeared an invention already at war's end in 2003, let alone today.

As Hoffman discusses, identities are always fluid and associations "provisional and contingent" (23), which alone suggests the lack of this kind of permanence. While

this impermanence might be taken as proof of Hoffman's idea that ex-combatants' "movement ... and the labors of their bodies have become their sole productive resources" (87), this kind of nomadism, however, contradicts with his earlier research that has emphasized the importance of relations, the maintaining of which requires at least a semblance of stability. Overall, it is reasonable to argue that Monrovia youth at large are also subjected to the same processes and structures, and fall into the same "gaps" as former combatants, making the focus on this narrower group both distracting and unnecessary for the broader argument of "Monrovia Modern."

Even Hoffman's qualification of the urban warfare in Liberia requires nuancing. Despite the repeated mentions of "heavy artillery" and "urban warfare" in the book, few heavy weapons were used after the early 1990s in general, while Monrovia only experienced a handful of battles. What was called "artillery" consisted of light mortars and antiaircraft guns. While able to penetrate walls and collapse small structures, compared to cities in places like Syria there were actually few ruins caused directly by the war in Monrovia. The ruins discussed in the book are rather by-products of the war, which resulted in the failing of political projects.

This focus on conflict is likely a remnant of the unchanged status of Liberia as a post-war country. While Hoffman makes keen observations regarding the origins of the forms investigated in the photo essays, more emphasis is given to architecture than to the political projects that sought to manifest themselves through these forms. As these projects clearly differed and resulted in competing nation- and state-building processes, more attention to this aspect would have made the overall relationship between form and politics clearer.

The main theoretical argument of the book is that ordering excludes some urban features, turning some ways of being in the city impossible (176). Perhaps the best recent example of the connection between space and politics comes from the Ukrainian capital Kyiv, where the 2013–2014 Euromaidan revolution revealed how a space – the Independence square – offers not only a place but also a script for political protest. According to Hoffman, similar political opportunities in Monrovia are negated by the way spaces in Monrovia are mostly interchangeable. It is only certain locations – such as the four investigated in the book – which resist this kind of generic nature.

Hoffman does not have a positive view of the future in Monrovia, which to him rather appears like a "nostalgia for the future" (151) – an idealized past that contains better prospects. Even if a more realistic vision for future had existed, those inhabiting the four ruins then have failed to innovate a shared political identity that could realize it. In the absence of this critical relationship between space and construction of identity, cash remains the main way to mobilize any kind of mass action. Future, in other words, appears bleak. As the ex-combatants illustrate, little appears to have changed in the post-conflict.

Hoffman is correct in pointing out that similar mobilization as in Ukraine or in the countries that partook in the Arab spring has not taken place in modern Monrovia. Yet

the focus on squatters who inhabit three of the four ruins closely connected to specific political projects (the fourth, Hotel Africa, was uninhabited and rather emphasizes how removed the elites have been from the rest of the society in Liberia) one has to raise the question of generalizability from his cases. While these microanalyses offer both interesting thoughts and often almost lifelike descriptions of these landmarks and their inhabitants, the resulting story is, nevertheless, a somewhat static image of Monrovia life, further removed from everyday Liberian sociopolitical realities by the forays into more general architectural developments elsewhere. Despite the stagnated politics and continued economic uncertainty, much more than a building boom has happened in Monrovia and Liberia after the war ended. To give only two instances of nonviolent voluntary mass action, Monrovia gathered to rejoice with the football victory over Tunisia in September 2015, and to mourn after the death of the rising rap star Quincy B in March 2017. While not the Arab spring, these two events still point to something new.

The issues raised above, however, do little to diminish the many merits of the work, which in more than one way constitutes a pioneering work in the way it combines different methods, media, and disciplines. While this reviewer's interests mostly leans towards the political, "Monrovia Modern" also advances the apparently limited literature on African architecture. Overall, Hoffman's newest is a beautiful work that one truly enjoys reading. While some issues in "Monrovia Modern" are debatable, the fact alone that it raises interesting questions serves as proof of its worth, and the power of anthropology and other cultural studies in probing questions central to the future of humanity. One can only hope that it will encourage others to follow the course now set.

Ilmari Käihkö

**Hoffmann, Beatrix, and Karoline Noack** (eds.): *Apalai – Tiriyó – Wayana ... Objects\_Collections\_Databases*. Aachen: Shaker Verlag, 2017. 289 pp. ISBN 978-3-8440-4812-4. (Bonner Amerikanistische Studien – BAS, 52) Price: € 49,80

La cobertura de las etnias sudamericanas en la investigación antropológica ha sido muy diferente. De algunas de ellas existe una gran cantidad de monografías y trabajos etnográficos, por motivos que generalmente respondían a intereses de los observadores occidentales. Así, la mayor cantidad de trabajos versan sobre los Yanomami (Venezuela y Brasil), los Shuar/Jíbaro (Perú y Ecuador), y en las últimas décadas sobre los Huaorani de Ecuador. No es casual que en estas tres etnias las guerras hayan ocupado (y aún ocupen a veces, como en el caso de los Huaorani) un papel destacado (a lo que se suma, en cuanto a los grupos Jíbaro, la reducción de cabezas de enemigos hasta épocas más o menos recientes).

Entre las etnias de las cuales la bibliografía es menor o más escasa, se hallan los Apalai (unas 500 personas) y Wayana (unas 2.000), de lengua caribe, que habitan en las zonas fronterizas de Brasil, Guayana Francesa y Suriname, y que son el foco de esta obra. (Secundariamente

se tratan los Tiriyó, que tienen estrechas relaciones con ellos). De la bibliografía hay que destacar los trabajos de Nimuendajú y los de Daniel Schoepf, en la década de 1970, cuya calidad y profundización en la cultura indígena hacen desear al lector que este autor hubiera tenido una producción más numerosa.

La obra aquí comentada surgió a partir de un encuentro sobre el tema – entre los que se hallaban dos personas Wayana –, basado en la necesidad de dar a conocer y estudiar la colección recogida por Manfred Rauschert entre 1954–55 y 1976 en territorio brasileño, y que se halla en BASA (Bonner Altamerika-Sammlung), en la Abteilung für Altamerikanistik de la Universidad de Bonn, Alemania). El objetivo es crear un archivo digital de las colecciones presentes en museos europeos, que sea accesible también a los Apalai y Wayana. A dicho archivo se incorporan asimismo grabaciones de sonido, películas, fotografías etc. De aquí surgió, a partir del año 2015, el proyecto "Man-Thing-Entanglements in Indigenous Societies", financiado por el BMBF (Ministerio de Investigación, según sus siglas alemanas), una colaboración entre museos alemanes, austríacos, de Paramaribo (Surinam), Belém y São Paulo (Brasil), el CNRS de París y el Archivo de sonidos de Viena.

El libro se halla dividido en tres partes; la primera de ellas contiene dos artículos dedicados a la investigación temprana de estas etnias: Beatrix Hoffmann analiza los informes de los primeros viajes a los Apalai de Brasil (Nimuendajú, Felix Speiser y Protásio Friel) en las primeras décadas del siglo; además ha transcritto material inédito, como las notas de Protásio Friel, que se hallan en el Museo Paraense Emilio Goeldi, de Belém y las de Felix Speiser en Basilea. Michael Kraus, por su parte, profundiza en los viajes de Nimuendajú y el destino de las colecciones.

La segunda parte comprende artículos que presentan las colecciones que se hallan depositadas en varios museos etnográficos de Alemania, como el de Hamburgo (Christine Chávez), Berlín (Richard Haas), Stuttgart (Doris Kurella), y el de Basilea en Suiza (Beatrix Hoffmann, sobre los Tiriyó).

Los artículos reunidos logran darle, desde distintas perspectivas (desde la museología a la historia de la investigación), gran unidad a la obra. Hay que destacar el aporte de Eliane Camargo, una lingüista especializada en esta lengua caribe. Dado que no es posible comentar la docena de artículos que contiene el libro, me detendré brevemente en tres de ellos.

En "Ethnological Entrepreneurs in Brazil. Spotlights on the Peripheral Areas of a West/East German History of the Field and of Collecting" (141–168), Karoline Noack se centra en dos coleccionistas que practicaron la etnografía desde fuera del mundo académico, y que, si bien no alejados entre sí cronológicamente, actuaron en dos países de distintos sistemas políticos y sociales: Manfred Rauschert (1928–2006) en la Alemania Federal y Erich Wustmann (1907–1994), nacido en Sajonia, en la Alemania Democrática.

Partiendo de Manfred Rauschert, del cual BASA posee una extensa colección de los Apalai y Wayana recogida por él a lo largo de varias décadas, Noack analiza los