currently has around 45 members and emphasizes collaborative and "co-creative" knowledge making (3).

The book, advertised as a teaching resource for advanced undergraduate and graduate students, is a slender one that can best be described as a compendium: on less than 150 pages, it offers inspiration on how to thicken one's ethnographic practice through the modes of experimental ethnographic writing, sensing, sound studies/recording and editing, walking, and performing.

Introducing the volume, Dara Culhane situates creative ethnography in the aftermath of the Writing Culture debate and its stake against positivist, interrogative, and authoritative modes of ethnography. The introduction also provides a discussion of imagination, a key term of the book. Culhane considers both imagination and creativity as practices of everyday life worthy not just of ethnographic attention but of becoming part of ethnographic methodology. This is to be achieved through creative ethnographic modes that are "attentive to the everyday and the extraordinary, the sensorial, the forgotten, the obvious, the messy" (18) and takes "sensory, embodied, affective knowledge" very seriously. Throughout the text, however, imagination keeps deliberately being evoked rather than conceptualized (15), and it does not always become clear how the use of imagination is similar to, or different from, the fictional, speculative, transversal, original, phantasmatic, or a general education of attention. This is very understandable given the process-orientedness of the approaches that are being presented but remains to be an interesting and important conceptual question.

Denielle Elliott, in chap. 2, offers possibilities for written imaginative ethnography. She presents stimuli for both form and content from fiction and creative nonfiction (25) and offers a plethora of examples of narrative-based experimental ethnographies from the days of the Writing Culture debate to satire, SMS speak, twitter essays, and graphic novels. Chapter 3, "Sensing" (Dara Culhane), is rich in exercises that make the canonical literature on sensory ethnography and the anthropology of the senses that is being presented here relatable. The creation of "sensory embodied reflexivity" (49), an education of attention, is its main focus.

Alexandrine Boudreault-Fournier (chap. 4) zooms in on the role of editing and montage in ethnographic sound and image making. Sound and image recordings serve, according to Boudreault-Fournier, "as catalysts that encourage researchers and students to reflect upon where they stand, with whom, and how" (71). She suggests that "cinematic imagination" (MacDougall), the appropriation, idiosyncratic perception and interpretation of what is happening in film and also in audio, is present both in producers and audiences of audio-visual interventions (75, 78). This re-imagination, she suggests, is closely tied to polysensory experiences of place that can be evoked through these media.

"Walking" (chap. 5), by Cristina Moretti, takes up similar questions of attunement through the practice of walking. Focussing on researching cities, the chapter provides exercises for researching public spaces through walking alone or with interlocutors. Moretti finds walking to be not only a way of attunement but also of production: walking can "be a way of telling, commenting on, performing, and creating both stories and places" (95). Magdalena Kazubowski-Houston's chapter (Performing) takes readers along her own process of imagining a fairy tale performance with her Polish Roma interlocutor Randia. A trained theatre director, Kazubowski-Houston develops a fictional dramatic script (116) based on Randia's life story. Discussing her process, she shows how doing so is less a form of representation but rather a way of imagining aspects of an interlocutors experience that are otherwise difficult to articulate.

"A Different Kind of Ethnography. Imaginative Practices and Imaginative Methodologies" is a generous and helpful introduction book on angles that have become very important in the last decade. Don't be fooled by 144 pages – it offers up much more than that: all chapters come with an appendix offering a wealth of examples, exercises, and further resources. It is really through a deeper engagement with these resources that the sometimes a little abstract and overused sounding incantation of sensuousness, relationality, affectivity, procesuality, etc. becomes tangible. It offers a great deal of orientation for emerging practitioners in the field of original ethnography and it will undoubtedly be very helpful in educational settings and as a resource for sharing approaches with creative collaborators coming from non-ethnographic backgrounds. The chapters mirror the individual interest and expertise of the contributors, all creative ethnographers in their own right. It does not claim to be comprehensive and thus does not touch in depth on some more recent developments like multispecies ethnography, which started as a collaborative and creative project to begin with, the edge effects between conceptual art and ethnography, or the importance of affect and materiality that have complemented sensory ethnography. In the spirit of the CIE and its ongoing call for collaboration, however, this should be read as an invitation. Susanne Schmitt

Feldhaus, Anne, Ramdas Atkar, and **Rajaram Zagade** (eds.): Say to the Sun, "Don't Rise," and to the Moon, "Don't Set." Two Oral Narratives from the Countryside of Maharashtra. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2014. 613 pp. ISBN 978-0-19-935764-2. Price: £ 64.00

This translation of two traditional oral narratives of a shepherd community in western India stands as a rich and copious archive of traditional narrative materials and ethnographic observations that will be of great benefit to a wide range of scholars interested in oral performance, folk religion, or rural/pastoral culture in South Asia. This volume offers a vivid glimpse into the fluid cultural lives of the Dhangars, a seminomadic pastoral community of the Deccan Plateau, while at the same time creating a valuable point of access into alternative dimensions of Hindu thought and practice that lie beyond the scope of the normative Brahmanical traditions. Readers of this book, in other words, will find themselves both immersed in the intricate narrative imaginary of the Dhangars and able to appreciate the distinctive religious and

https://doi.org/10.5771/0257-9774-2018-1-299
Generiert durch IP '3.16.47.175', am 04.09.2024, 10:30:30.
Das Erstellen und Weitergeben von Kopien dieses PDFs ist nicht zulässig.

cultural identity of this minority community as articulated on their own terms. Furthermore, this translation allows us to travel back in time, as it were, to revisit the work of the late German Indologist Günther-Dietz Sontheimer, whose original ethnographic field recordings, made in the early 1970s, serve as the source materials for Feldhaus and her collaborators.

An industrious scholar of Indian folk religion, Sontheimer had spent years in western India conducting meticulous research on the cultural, social, and religious lives of various pastoralist communities, whose principal deities – Birobā, Mhaskobā, and Khaṇḍobā – became the subject of Sontheimer's 1976 Habilitation thesis, which Feldhaus subsequently translated into English as "Pastoral Deities in Western India" (1989). In the quarter-century since his untimely death in 1992, Feldhaus and other scholars have worked tirelessly to bring Sontheimer's unpublished research into scholarly circulation. In 2006, Feldhaus, Atkar, and Zagade collaborated to publish Marathi transcripts of audio recordings that Sontheimer had made of two lengthy narrative texts belonging to a traditional Dhangar performance genre known as the *ovi* (strung together). The present volume consists of complete, verbatim English translations of those Marathi texts, along with a detailed, five-chapter introduction authored by Feldhaus that outlines the structure, style, and content of the two *ovis*, and then investigates what these stories might tell us about pastoral life and gender relations among the Dhangars.

In the first chapter, Feldhaus sets the background for the project, provides synopses of both oral narratives translated in the book, and describes the context in which Sontheimer had originally made the recordings. The stories are called *ovis*, but this differs from the more common usage of the *ovi* as a poetic meter in the Marathi *bhakti* tradition. The *ovi* meter is thought to have its origins in women's household worksongs, and is exemplified in the compositions of Jñāneśvar, Janābāī, and other medieval poet-saints. The Dhangar *ovi*, on the other hand, denotes a distinct tradition of storytelling performance in which a mixture of verses and prose passages is delivered by teams of singers, detailing the myths and legends of the pastoral deities revered by the Dhangars. One might be tempted to call it an "oral epic," though Feldhaus wisely urges caution against using this label for the Dhangar *ovi*, since it does not take on the kinds of regionalist or nationalist discourses that oral epics often do (16 f.). Still, like oral epics, these *ovis* are fixed articulations within a fluid performance tradition of long, mythic/heroic stories that become cultural sites of self-constitution for the wider community. And so, as they tell of the birth, childhood, marriage, and terrestrial adventures two key Dhangar deities – Birobā and Dhuḷobā – these *ovis* also serve as foundational narratives for the Dhangars' own ways of life.

In chapter two, Feldhaus explores the form, style, and texture of the *ovis* and gives helpful overviews of substories, drama, humor, and other narrative techniques found within them. She outlines the formal features of Dhangar *ovi* performance, in which memorized verses are interspersed with commentarial and narrative prose. It is a group performance, involving two pairs of singers, a "front" pair that tells the main story and a "back" pair that provides accompaniment, reinforcement, and dialogic engagement. In both form and style, the Dhangar *ovi* thus appears, at least superficially, to have resonances with the Vārkarī *kīrtan* and other regional performance genres. It would have been valuable if some of these resemblances had been explored in greater depth, so that we may potentially gain better insight about how distinct folk performance traditions coevolved and intersected within the same regional milieu. This is a phenomenon that happens across the Indian subcontinent, but especially so in Maharashtra, where genres like *kīrtan*, *gondhaḷ*, and *tamāśā* have flourished side by side for centuries.

The rest of Feldhaus's introduction then takes the reader further into the Dhangar cultural imaginary as revealed by the two *ovis*, providing an excellent primer for readers unfamiliar with the worldview and religious culture of this pastoral community. Especially laudable is Feldhaus's conscious resistance against applying abstract scholarly theories to her materials; instead of potentially overburdening them with jargon, she lets the texts speak for themselves. In chapter three, Feldhaus investigates the spatial aspects of the two *ovis* by showing how they reveal a tripartite vertical cosmology (heaven, earth, underworld), and how they invoke a localized geographical imaginary centered around places and travel routes in and around Maharashtra that would be familiar to Dhangar audiences. This is where Feldhaus's observations are especially thought-provoking. The binary division of settled place (village/city) versus wild space (forest/jungle) is quite robust throughout the Brahminical Hindu tradition since the time of the "Upaniṣads." But the pastoral perspective of the Dhangars complicates this dichotomy – agricultural villages play only a minor role in the action, while the wilderness is not merely a space of inhuman danger and terror, but also a site of refuge or escape from political threats coming from towns and villages. This is perhaps reflective of the cultural realities of the semi-nomadic Dhangar shepherds, whose own encampments are mobile and whose relationships with agricultural villages are transactional. As Feldhaus puts it, these stories at times touch upon "the kind of strife between farmers and pastoralists that is typical of many parts of the world including Maharashtra" (70 f.). The deeper connections between story and strife are left unexplored, but Feldhaus has assembled together the relevant passages for conducting this kind of investigation about rural life in Maharashtra. As she mentions, she has indeed begun to draft a separate monograph on this topic (58).

Chapter four investigates how Dhangar shepherds and their pastoral settlements (*vāḍās*) are depicted within the two *ovis*, and how this reflects Dhangar social identity. She finds that while the *ovis* operate with a comprehensive taxonomy of social groups in the Maharashtra countryside, the nature of what constitutes a "caste" (*jāti*) remains vague within the narratives. Dhangars and others are clearly portrayed as distinct occupational groups within the *ovis*, but the features of endogamy, hierarchy, and pollution seem not to be consistently applied, so that, as

https://doi.org/10.5771/0257-9774-2018-1-299
Generiert durch IP '3.16.47.175', am 04.09.2024, 10:30:30.
Das Erstellen und Weitergeben von Kopien dieses PDFs ist nicht zulässig.

Feldhaus puts it, “caste in the *ovis* involves at least as complex a set of attitudes and practices as it does in real life” (94). This is an entirely reasonable observation, but it remains an open research question how, if at all, *ovi* performances themselves have impacted the real-life political and economic struggles of the Dhangars as a caste in contemporary India. Addressing this issue might perhaps help to explain why, as Feldhaus was surprised to find, one of the *ovi* performers (Dājī Rāmā Pokale) broke out of the storytelling frame and became critical of his own community for not being progressive enough (107). As I will explain below, the circumstances of its publication understandably prevented such fieldwork from being integrated into this book, but it is a desideratum if we are to grasp how performance culture does or does not play an active role in the lives of Dhangars today.

In the fifth and final chapter, Feldhaus turns to one other fascinating aspect of the *ovis* – the construction of gender identities and the development of female-centered themes, such as fertility, virginity, and lactation. Though the stories are known to Dhangar women, the two recordings were performed by men, and with only men present. Feldhaus thus discerns a consistent male “stamp” in the *ovi* performances, in which misogynistic stereotypes are used for comedic effect. She details a number of incidents of slapstick domestic violence in the *ovis*, where the target of the joke is the simple-minded shepherd who unfairly beats his wife. Here, as Feldhaus puts it, “although the artists are indeed making light of denigration of and violence toward women, what they are primarily making fun of is themselves – or at least, their own kind” (116).

The two translated *ovis*, which comprise the bulk of the volume, are an absorbing read. The “Story of Birobā” is a recording of four singers made by Sontheimer over four nights (7.5 hours of tape) at a shepherd village in the Sangli district of southern Maharashtra, while the longer “Story of Dhuḷobā” (12.5 hours) was sung by a solo performer from Satara, who had travelled to Sontheimer’s residence in Pune. Feldhaus and her collaborators give us an excellent example of how one might effectively translate oral performances such as these without overburdening them with notes or technical apparatus. In the “Story of Birobā,” for example, the oration of the lead singers is presented in normal typeface, while the back singers’ voices are placed in smallcaps. The result is a rather elegant reconstruction of the dialogicality of live performance. Ample footnotes are given to explain linguistic and cultural peculiarities in the *ovis*, but rarely are there more than two or three per page, so as not to distract the reader from the stories themselves.

In closing, it is perhaps worth discussing what exactly these texts are, and whether we are to think of them as “authentic” Dhangar *ovis*. All translations are, by definition, simulacra of the original texts. However, there is another degree of temporal remove in this translation – the recordings were made in the early 1970s of performers who are now deceased, by a German scholar who is himself also deceased. As Feldhaus notes, she and her collaborators thus had no way of interviewing the performers or the audience, and had to rely primarily on the memories of Atkar and Zagade, who were present at the recording sessions as research assistants, to reconstruct the original performance contexts. Furthermore, these days, it seems, the pressure of Indian popular culture has made it so that “no one is interested in singing *ovis* anymore” (14). We may surmise, therefore, that the *ovis* published in this book do not impact the daily lives of Dhangars today as they did forty years ago. This should not, however, take anything away from the merits of this publication. As with other vulnerable minority groups around the world, the cultural identity of the Dhangars has become somewhat of a political football, and rarely, it seems, are Dhangar voices heard within mainstream cultural settings without some sort of political orchestration. Thus, while these Dhangar *ovis* are indeed snapshots from a bygone era, their publication in a scholarly setting offers general readers in India and abroad – and perhaps the Dhangars themselves – an opportunity to hear traditional Dhangar voices from the past, on their own terms and in rich and luxurious detail, and to appreciate the distinctive religious culture that had been cultivated through this Dhangar oral tradition.

Adheesh Sathaye

Frembgen, Jürgen Wasim: The Arts and Crafts of the Hunza Valley in Pakistan. Living Traditions in the Karakoram. Karachi: Oxford University Press, 2017. 110 pp. ISBN 978-0-19-940520-6. Price: Pak Rs. 1,425.00

“Dedicated to the people of Hunza and Nager, especially to the female embroiderers and craftsmen,” this book is a most welcome new publication about Hunza in northernmost Pakistan – a wide valley deep inside the majestic mountain world of the western Karakoram. The construction of the KKH, the Karakoram Highway, leading from central Pakistan through the Indus Valley and then through the Hunza Valley and across the high Khunjerab Pass to Kashgar in Xinjiang, had made the previously difficult and risky access (with pathways and then jeepable tracks running often high up on very steep mountain slopes) to that of a highway. In due course, Hunza became a touristic paradise (and a thoroughfare for transit between Pakistan and China) and easily accessible for researchers. Nowadays approach is risky due to threats by Taliban, but once there one can feel safe and free to enjoy both the dramatic beauties of the unique landscape with its grandiose mountain peaks and the two somewhat different cultural entities found on the two sides of the valley, the one facing south, the other facing north.

There is a cultural chasm between the two valley sides based on differences in the Islamic belief systems, as the inhabitants of the northern half adhere to the (comparatively liberal) Ismaeli creed while the southern half, known as Nager, is dominated by (rather stern) Twelver Shia beliefs with their lack of much tolerance towards its opposite. However, both sides speak mainly Burushaski (an archaic, still “unclassified” idiom), and religious differences do not hinder the great passion for polo, played mainly by the social elite on fields which are constructed large enough, a difficult undertaking on mountain slopes, to provide sufficient space for a game with horses.

https://doi.org/10.5771/0257-9774-2018-1-299
Generiert durch IP '3.16.47.175', am 04.09.2024, 10:30:30.
Das Erstellen und Weitergeben von Kopien dieses PDFs ist nicht zulässig.