Kishangarh court's virtually unknown experiments with early Urdu. One important theme is *javābgū'ī*, or creative response. An expert reading of two of Valī Dakhanī's poems in conjunction with Nāgarīdās' response poems shows that this so-called Braj Bhāṣā poet was actively engaging with Urdu literary culture. Moreover, none of this was the least incongruous with the Hindu devotional expression that Nāgarīdās is known for.

Nāgarīdās' *Iśq-caman* (Garden of Love), for its part, is a sustained Urdu work that is demonstrably in keeping with Mughal literary sensibility. The analysis of Nāgarīdās' Urdu experiments in *Iśq-caman* is wonderful.

Particularly fascinating is the discovery of an informal notebook of Rasik Bihārī, the nom de plume of Nāgarīdās' beloved *pāsbān* or courtesan-companion, Banī-ṭhanī. She too experimented with the new literary trends. We see, for instance, evidence of her connoisseurship, as when she recorded reactions to recent Rekhtā compositions in her notebook.

Pauwels' explorations of the afterlife of *Iśq-caman* are also interesting. For instance, the Mewar ruler Aḍi Singh responded to *Iśq-caman* with a full-length work, *Rasik-caman*. And Rājā Pratāp Singh of Jaipur, who wrote under the pen name Brajnidhi, was also influenced by Nāgarīdās in his experiments with Urdu poetic style. Readers can develop a fuller appreciation of *javābgū'ī* by turning to the appendix of the book to study *Iśq-caman* and *Rasik-caman* (the latter has never before been published) in tandem. The translations and transliterations are a useful supplement to the volume, though Pauwels' attempt to preserve the end rhyme of the Rekhtā couplets can feel forced in places.

Pauwels uses paintings to augment her analysis of literary material throughout the book, and they become a special focus in chap. 3. In this era, Rajput painting is not just a domain where provincial outposts benefit from the trickle down of expertise from Mughal masters; instead, she rightly stresses the creative circulations between these milieus. There are demonstrably shared repertoires, as with calligraphy, Laylā and Majnūn motifs, portraiture, and *majlis* scenes.

In the final chapter, Pauwels offers example after example of how and why literary and visual traditions are best seen in concert. Nāgarīdās sometimes had specific verses of his own poetry illustrated. Pauwels also provides several highly plausible parallels and identifications for paintings that show looser connections to Nāgarīdās' poetry. Still, the key point is not that we should limit ourselves to evaluating whether a painting corresponds to a poem but to understand that visual and literary traditions deeply complemented one another and were part of the same shared Mughal-Rajput ecumene.

Crucial to various discussions in the book, though not a stated focus, is the agency of women. We have already referred to Banī-ṭhanī, the beloved courtesan of Sāvant Singh who was also the accomplished poetess Rasik Bihārī. She figures in the paintings of the court and was also an inspiration for some of Nāgarīdās' poetry. Since she spent her early years in Delhi Pauwels wonders if she had a role to play in bringing the early Urdu fashions to Kishangarh. Marriages, too, were instrumental in this kind of exchange of ideas, as brides moved into other royal houses (Muʿaẓẓam, Aurangzeb's son, married a Kishangarhi princess), bringing with them the cultural habits of their natal homes. And, as with Rasik Bihārī, they were occasionally authors. Another example is Sāvant Singh's stepmother, Braj Kumvarī Baṅkāvatī, who composed under the pen name "Brajdāsī" and contributed to the literary and religious life of the court with her translation of the *Bhāgavata-purāṇa*.

One thing is clear: Heidi Pauwels' impressive book succeeds in deepening our understanding of an important early modern poet as well as opening up a new vista on 18th-century cultural life. This was a lively, multilingual world where Rajputs and Mughals – and the women they loved – contributed richly to cultural exchange.

Allison Busch

Petric, Boris: Where Are All Our Sheep? Kyrgyzstan, a Global Political Arena. New York: Berghahn Books, 2015. 170 pp. ISBN 978-1-78238-783-1. (Dislocation, 16). Price: $ 90.00

In "Where Are All Our Sheep?" Boris Petric seeks to "give an account of a journey into the heart of Kyrgyz political logic" (xi). Drawing on fieldwork in mountainous Naryn region between 2000 and 2009 and interviews with members of the Kyrgyz political elite, Petric examines the mechanisms by which the Kyrgyzstani state has been hollowed out and its economic resources plundered. The narrative moves between ethnographic detail and sweeping political commentary to reveal how the country's political volatility (with two presidents ousted by popular uprisings in the space of five years) has resulted from a peculiar alliance of interests, including international lending organizations, NGOs, think tanks, embassies, and election monitors. Countering perceptions of Kyrgyzstan as an out-of-the-way place untouched by currents of globalization, Petric shows how the country became a laboratory for a particularly violent experiment in economic and political transformation in the aftermath of Soviet collapse, grounded in an essentialized version of Kyrgyz national history that marginalized the country's sizeable Uzbek and Russian minorities. The alliance of domestic and international interests created a narrow elite who profited from the rapid privatization of rural assets at the same time that it left the vast majority of the population in a situation of acute economic hardship, relying on petty trade and the consumption of livestock assets to survive, and increasingly disillusioned with a "democracy" in which votes and public office were seen to be for sale.

The book is organized into seven chapters, followed by a "Conclusion" and an "Afterward" that explores the 2010 inter-communal violence that left over 400 people dead in the southern cities of Osh and Jalabat. The seven core chapters focus on a series of inter-linked theme, including the rise of ethno-nationalism and the elevation of ethnically-marked symbols of Kyrgyz heritage to the status of national icons; the role of international organizations in promoting the NGO-ization of society; the shift

in rural livelihoods from pastoralism to petty trade and external labor migration as a result of the devastating experiment in privatization; and the undermining of state capacity through the development of a family-government under Presidents Akayev (1991–2005) and Bakiyev (2005–2010).

While each of these themes has been touched upon in the extant ethnographic literature on Kyrgyzstan, Petric's monograph is novel in digging into the ideas and practices of those at the sharp end of this project of political and economic reform. In the Introduction, for instance, we see the shifting configuration of power at village level, as the former kolkhoz director turns into an entrepreneur who is able to profit disproportionately from newly-privatized kolkhoz machinery, while the former *murab* responsible for water-allocation drives a Lada Niva donated by the World Bank and teaches his fellow villagers a "new ideology encouraging individual initiative and responsibility" (22). In chapters 3 and 6, which focus on democracy promotion and election monitoring, respectively, we see how parliamentary elections become an opportunity for the circulation of newly-acquired resources and the site for competing articulations of power, as economic elites seek to secure newly-gained wealth through parliamentary immunity.

Some of the most illuminating detail concerns the emergence of a market economy, in the sense of an economy spatially and politically oriented towards the *bazaar* and the trade in goods from China. In chap. 5 Petric explores the emergence of the *bazarkoms*, market directors, from among an elite of Communist Party members with access to specific resources in the early 1990s. These figures were able to transform their comparative advantage in the form of knowledge, political contacts, and access to newly-privatized land and buildings to sudden and dramatic wealth, such as the well-travelled head of the Kyrgyz SSR sports committee, Askar Salymbekov, who used his newfound familiarity with markets in Moscow and Odessa to turn a bankrupt sheep-tanning factory into a vast open trading ground on the outskirts of Bishkek: one that later became "Dordoy," Central Asia's largest wholesale market and source of livelihood to around 150,000 citizens.

Such cases provide illuminating material for an understanding of how privatization and a narrowly-conceived electoral democracy (which often simply meant votes-for-cash) undermined faith in the government and its elected representatives. This is not, however, just a story of Kyrgyzstani elites taking advantage of economic liberalization to concentrate public goods in their hands.

Indeed, it is the missionary zeal of the white-jeep-driving international "experts," high on the prospect of "coloured revolutions" and convinced that democracy could be imported sufficient technical expertise, who are the particular target of critique, such as the jobbing Serbian election observer who proudly announced that "I did Georgia and Ukraine, and I can't wait to see what are we are going to do here."

This is a passionate and at times polemical book, pitched for a broad audience largely unfamiliar with the region. Scholars of Kyrgyzstan may wish for more nuances in his treatment of political dynamics in the country: the international actors tend to come across as rather caricatured and ideologically-driven, ignoring the complex forms of ethical reasoning in which they might be engaged. At the same time, the ethnographic narrative points to, but does not really explore in comparative or theoretical terms, the unexpected alliances, and opportunistic complicity in process of political and economic decimation in which local communities were also enrolled. It is notable in this respect that while the book's original French title, "On a mangé nos moutons" (We Have Eaten Our Sheep) points to this ambivalence of unwilling collusion in a series of opaque and ideologically-driven reforms, the English title, "Where Are All Our Sheep?" implies rather a sense of helpless shock at the scale and speed of a transformation over which one has little agency. This is partly a question of narrative framing: bibliographic references are few, and while reference is made to other scholars, Petric is ultimately aligning himself in opposition to popular stereotypes about the country rather than situating himself deeply within an anthropological conversation about experiments in state transformation that have been introduced in a variety of post-Soviet settings. In the preface, for instance, we learn that "bordering the former USSR and China, this small country is imagined to be the perfect anthropological playground" (viii): a straw-man claim that does not really do justice to the considerable body of ethnographic literature to have emerged on political life in Kyrgyzstan over the last decade. Nonetheless, this is a wide-ranging and engaging book, which provides a vivid portrait of the fall-out from two decades of economic and political experimentation in this "laboratory" for democratic reform in Central Asia.

Madeleine Reeves

Ram, Kalpana, and **Christopher Houston** (eds.): Phenomenology in Anthropology. A Sense of Perspective. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2015, 318 pp. ISBN 978-0-253-01775-8. Price: $ 35.00

Phenomenological approaches in anthropology have, with the exception of individual figures like Irving Hallowell, gained a certain visibility only in the 1980s and 1990s. In particular, Thomas Csordas's work on embodiment and Michael Jackson's existential anthropology were instrumental in this rise to prominence. Both these anthropologists connected their individual work with those of others in an effort to consolidate phenomenological anthropology as an established field of study. Csordas published an edited collection in 1994, titled "Embodiment and Experience," Jackson followed 1996 with "Things as They Are." Kalpana Ram and Christopher Houston's "Phenomenology in Anthropology. A Sense of Perspective" not only follows in this tradition, but also features texts by Csordas (a regular chapter) and Jackson (an afterword). Moreover, the collection also includes contributions by a number of other well-known phenomenological anthropologists, Robert Desjarlais, Greg Downey, and Jason Throop. The rest of the 12 chapters of the volume is authored by anthropologists whose ties to phenome-