

Sermone entstanden neu – unter Beibehaltung der traditionellen Form.

Lange Zeit als orale Überlieferungen betrachtet, zeigt es sich, dass diese Texte auch in schriftlicher Form tradiert wurden. Auf der beiliegenden DVD finden sich neben den Tonaufnahmen die digitalisierten Hefte der *sermoneros*, darunter eine Niederschrift, datiert 1950. Das ist besonders bemerkenswert, weil die indigene Bevölkerung vor der Schulreform 1952 nicht in den Genuss von Schulunterricht kam und schon gar nicht in der indigenen Sprache. Ein Vergleich mit jesuitischen Manuskripten aus der Region zeigt, dass die Orthografie des 18. bis Mitte des 20. Jh.s zeitgleich beibehalten wurde.

Der Herausgeber erklärt in der Einführung die getroffenen Entscheidungen in Bezug auf die Verschriftung. Bei neu transkribierten Texten kommt das neue offizielle Alphabet zur Anwendung, mit einigen Abwandlungen zur Repräsentation der lokalen Variante. Bei älteren Texten wird die originale Schreibung respektiert. Die Tonaufnahmen dienen der Vermittlung von Aussprache und Rhythmus, der ein wesentliches Merkmal der Darbietung ist.

Chiquitano (oder: Besiro) zählt heute zu den bedrohten Sprachen und wird kaum mehr in den Familien gesprochen. Man kann sie nur mehr im Kontext religiöser Feste im öffentlichen Raum hören. Die *sermoneros* erfüllen nach ihrem Selbstverständnis eine heilige Pflicht und dafür wird ihnen große Wertschätzung entgegengebracht. Der Vortrag der Sermone ist außerdem an eine Funktion im *cabildo* gebunden. Diese Aspekte bewirken, dass die alte Sprache auch für die Jungen noch eine gewisse Bedeutung hat. Die junge Generation ist selbstbewusst, besitzt Schulbildung, hat größtenteils Zugang zu modernen Medien und ist durchaus imstande, ihre Traditionen mit modernen Mitteln zu pflegen. Die vorliegende Arbeit ist ein Beitrag zum Erhalt der Sprache und der religiösen Praktiken der Chiquitanos und stellt außerdem eine wertvolle Datenbasis für weitere Forschungen dar.

Sieglinde Falkinger

Pauwels, Heidi Rika Maria: Cultural Exchange in Eighteenth-Century India. Poetry and Paintings from Kishangarh. Berlin: EB-Verlag Dr. Brandt, 2015. 301 pp. ISBN 978-3-86893-184-6. (Studies in Asian Art and Culture, 4) Price: € 45.00

Heidi Pauwels is to be heartily congratulated on her marvelous recent book, the culmination of years of research on the poet-king Sāvant Singh of Kishangarh (1699–1764), also known by his nom de plume, Nāgarīdās. “Cultural Exchange in Eighteenth-Century India. Poetry and Paintings from Kishangarh” has much to offer Hindi and Urdu scholars, historians and art historians, and general readers in South Asian studies. The book is divided into three long chapters, each dense with poetry, analysis, and relevant historical context. Twenty color plates as well as two poetry-filled appendices nicely augment the research presented in the main part of the book.

Chapter 1 sets the stage with its broad introduction to Indo-Muslim literary culture during Nāgarīdās’ lifetime. Nāgarīdās is usually remembered for his voluminous de-

votional writings in Braj Bhāṣā (classical Hindi) but he was also, as Pauwels demonstrates, creatively engaged with Urdu poetry (often known as Rekhtā). Here Pauwels is in line with recent scholarship – exemplary here is the work of Francesca Orsini – that stresses the importance of multilingual approaches to literary history.

Pauwels has a healthy suspicion of the usual literary historical narratives about Hindi and Urdu and is willing to examine evidence freshly as well as provide fresh evidence. Telling a “history of Urdu literature” or a “history of Hindi literature” without a strong commitment to the interactions of the two will leave strange gaps that reinforce modern religious and linguistic nationalism rather than clarifying the premodern material. Pauwels’ exhortation in the conclusion of the book to resist “facile anachronism deeming specific idioms ‘Hindu’ or ‘Muslim’” (215) is on the mark. In the canonical narrative, Valī Dakhaṇī’s poetry *divān* arrived in Delhi early in Muḥammad Shāh’s reign (1719–1748) and suddenly literary society was transformed. Indian literary historians have especially stressed the supposed hardening of linguistic identities around religious ones as an Urdu poetry tradition took shape from the 1720s. Matters are not so simple. Pauwels finds the theory that the rise of Urdu was essentially driven by religious concerns unconvincing. In general, the first few decades of Urdu were marked by far more experimentation and interchange with other languages than has generally been acknowledged. Only later, after the 1750s, did poets begin to self-consciously police the boundaries of Urdu by purging Braj Bhāṣā and other Indic words. An argument that deserves serious attention is the linking of the fledgling Urdu milieu to debates that governed the *Persian* literary public in late Mughal India. “Rather than a move away from a ‘Hindu’ register, [the rise of Urdu] ... was an assertion of Indian identity in the cosmopolitan playing field where Persian was the language of prestige” (61).

Another important argument from chap. 1 is that late Mughal political decentralization extended the capacity for literary patronage beyond the court in the form of *majlis* or evening soirées among members of the nobility. The generally elite thrust of *majlis* culture means, in Pauwels’ estimation, that the exchanges of views and vectors of opinion making stop short of being something akin to the type of European bourgeois public sphere theorized by Habermas, though elements of political critique by poets (she provides examples) do meet the benchmark.

In her somewhat breathless accounting of all kinds of performers and compositions and circulations it can be hard to see the forest for the trees in places, but the effort (evidently with collaboration from her colleague Purnima Dhavan) to trace thoroughly the key Braj Bhāṣā and Urdu figures of the 1720s and 1730s and map elements of a public sphere as well as trajectories across languages is worthwhile.

Chapter 2 is the heart of the book. Pauwels has published on Nāgarīdās before, and “Cultural Exchange in Eighteenth-Century India” is part of a larger endeavor to make his extensive oeuvre available to English readers. Here she presents fresh manuscript evidence for the

Kishangarh court's virtually unknown experiments with early Urdu. One important theme is *javābgū'ī*, or creative response. An expert reading of two of Valī Dakhanī's poems in conjunction with Nāgarīdās' response poems shows that this so-called Braj Bhāṣā poet was actively engaging with Urdu literary culture. Moreover, none of this was the least incongruous with the Hindu devotional expression that Nāgarīdās is known for.

Nāgarīdās' *Īṣq-caman* (Garden of Love), for its part, is a sustained Urdu work that is demonstrably in keeping with Mughal literary sensibility. The analysis of Nāgarīdās' Urdu experiments in *Īṣq-caman* is wonderful.

Particularly fascinating is the discovery of an informal notebook of Rasik Bihārī, the nom de plume of Nāgarīdās' beloved *pāsbān* or courtesan-companion, Banī-ṭhanī. She too experimented with the new literary trends. We see, for instance, evidence of her connoisseurship, as when she recorded reactions to recent Rekhtā compositions in her notebook.

Pauwels' explorations of the afterlife of *Īṣq-caman* are also interesting. For instance, the Mewar ruler Aḍī Singh responded to *Īṣq-caman* with a full-length work, *Rasik-caman*. And Rājā Pratāp Singh of Jaipur, who wrote under the pen name Brajnidhi, was also influenced by Nāgarīdās in his experiments with Urdu poetic style. Readers can develop a fuller appreciation of *javābgū'ī* by turning to the appendix of the book to study *Īṣq-caman* and *Rasik-caman* (the latter has never before been published) in tandem. The translations and transliterations are a useful supplement to the volume, though Pauwels' attempt to preserve the end rhyme of the Rekhtā couplets can feel forced in places.

Pauwels uses paintings to augment her analysis of literary material throughout the book, and they become a special focus in chap. 3. In this era, Rajput painting is not just a domain where provincial outposts benefit from the trickle down of expertise from Mughal masters; instead, she rightly stresses the creative circulations between these milieus. There are demonstrably shared repertoires, as with calligraphy, Laylā and Majnūn motifs, portraiture, and *majlis* scenes.

In the final chapter, Pauwels offers example after example of how and why literary and visual traditions are best seen in concert. Nāgarīdās sometimes had specific verses of his own poetry illustrated. Pauwels also provides several highly plausible parallels and identifications for paintings that show looser connections to Nāgarīdās' poetry. Still, the key point is not that we should limit ourselves to evaluating whether a painting corresponds to a poem but to understand that visual and literary traditions deeply complemented one another and were part of the same shared Mughal-Rajput ecumene.

Crucial to various discussions in the book, though not a stated focus, is the agency of women. We have already referred to Banī-ṭhanī, the beloved courtesan of Sāvant Singh who was also the accomplished poetess Rasik Bihārī. She figures in the paintings of the court and was also an inspiration for some of Nāgarīdās' poetry. Since she spent her early years in Delhi Pauwels wonders if she had a role to play in bringing the early Urdu fashions

to Kishangarh. Marriages, too, were instrumental in this kind of exchange of ideas, as brides moved into other royal houses (Mu'azzam, Aurangzeb's son, married a Kishangarhi princess), bringing with them the cultural habits of their natal homes. And, as with Rasik Bihārī, they were occasionally authors. Another example is Sāvant Singh's stepmother, Braj Kumvarī Baṅkāvātī, who composed under the pen name "Brajdāsī" and contributed to the literary and religious life of the court with her translation of the *Bhāgavata-purāṇa*.

One thing is clear: Heidi Pauwels' impressive book succeeds in deepening our understanding of an important early modern poet as well as opening up a new vista on 18th-century cultural life. This was a lively, multilingual world where Rajputs and Mughals – and the women they loved – contributed richly to cultural exchange.

Allison Busch

Petric, Boris: *Where Are All Our Sheep?* Kyrgyzstan, a Global Political Arena. New York: Berghahn Books, 2015. 170 pp. ISBN 978-1-78238-783-1. (Dislocation, 16). Price: \$ 90.00

In "Where Are All Our Sheep?" Boris Petric seeks to "give an account of a journey into the heart of Kyrgyz political logic" (xi). Drawing on fieldwork in mountainous Naryn region between 2000 and 2009 and interviews with members of the Kyrgyz political elite, Petric examines the mechanisms by which the Kyrgyzstani state has been hollowed out and its economic resources plundered. The narrative moves between ethnographic detail and sweeping political commentary to reveal how the country's political volatility (with two presidents ousted by popular uprisings in the space of five years) has resulted from a peculiar alliance of interests, including international lending organizations, NGOs, think tanks, embassies, and election monitors. Countering perceptions of Kyrgyzstan as an out-of-the-way place untouched by currents of globalization, Petric shows how the country became a laboratory for a particularly violent experiment in economic and political transformation in the aftermath of Soviet collapse, grounded in an essentialized version of Kyrgyz national history that marginalized the country's sizeable Uzbek and Russian minorities. The alliance of domestic and international interests created a narrow elite who profited from the rapid privatization of rural assets at the same time that it left the vast majority of the population in a situation of acute economic hardship, relying on petty trade and the consumption of livestock assets to survive, and increasingly disillusioned with a "democracy" in which votes and public office were seen to be for sale.

The book is organized into seven chapters, followed by a "Conclusion" and an "Afterward" that explores the 2010 inter-communal violence that left over 400 people dead in the southern cities of Osh and Jalabat. The seven core chapters focus on a series of inter-linked theme, including the rise of ethno-nationalism and the elevation of ethnically-marked symbols of Kyrgyz heritage to the status of national icons; the role of international organizations in promoting the NGO-ization of society; the shift