

Additional demonstrations erupted out of sympathy for the victims. Lee tells us the students' story of being portrayed as "*provokators*" as part of the justification by the state for the harsh crack down.

What "Activist Archives" does not do well enough is acknowledge and detail the degree to which students and other protestors have been used as a tool by the state or by military factions, or explain how the students interviewed view this complicated legacy. Whether it was KAMI being used in 1966 by Suharto to maneuver himself into power, or the rented crowds assembled by Suharto during New Order displays of manufactured political support (for Golkar), or opposition to Megawati or others, or the ability of Islamist groups like FPI (the Islamic Defenders Front) in the post-*reformasi* period to turn crowds out in the streets; political mobilization is often not autonomous or spontaneous. Most of these displays are not organic, they are manufactured by elites for very specific purposes. Lee might have used her book to explain how the youth movement sees itself in contrast to these manipulated behaviors. However, her task is really to do the opposite, to give agency to the young people who follow their passions and advocate for those who do not have a seat at the tables and halls of power. For that reason, Doreen Lee's book is well worth the read.

Amy L. Freedman

Lipset, David, and Eric K. Silverman (eds.): *Mortuary Dialogues. Death Ritual and the Reproduction of Moral Community in Pacific Modernities*. New York: Berghahn Books, 2016. 244 pp. ISBN 978-1-78533-171-8. (ASAO Studies in Pacific Anthropology, 7) Price: \$ 110.00

Across the Pacific as elsewhere, rituals surrounding death and mourning typically play a central role in processes of social reproduction, no less in post-contact circumstances than in earlier indigenous contexts. The contributions to this book take aim at the classic, century-old formulations of this connection between mortuary practice and moral community traced back to Hertz (i.e., parallel fates of deceased's body, spirit, and survivors), Van Gennep (i.e., rites of passage), and the *Année Sociologique* school led by Durkheim. The general conclusion is that the characteristic restoration of social order in the aftermath of the death achieved by mortuary rites in the past has been variously compromised in response to the vicissitudes of modernity – mainly the influences of commoditization, Christian missionization, and absorption in powerful but indifferent nation-states. Following Mikhail Bakhtin, this articulation is framed in terms of "mortuary dialogues," the talk and practices involving "many shifting and contradictory voices that privilege no authoritative position, single voice, or set of meanings" (234).

Aside from an informative "Foreword" by Shirley Lindenbaum and the editors' orienting "Introduction" and "Afterword," the substantive chapters illustrating the historical transformation of Oceanic death rites comprise one example from Polynesia (Māori), another from Micronesia (Enewetak), and seven from Melanesia (Kewa, Murik, Lihir, Misima, Manam, Kayan, Iatmul, I'ai). Among the

latter group of case studies, the Sepik region from Papua New Guinea is particularly well represented. One of the more noteworthy of the book's features is the great diversity in the content of the dialogues separately reported and the range of theoretical perspectives adopted to account for them within the dialogue rubric. Nonetheless, the editors have grouped the chapters into two sections more or less along the lines (uncited) of Marshall Sahlins's distinction between "develop-man" and "development." In the former instances, transformed mortuary practices in dialogue with factors of modernity have largely, and perhaps paradoxically, come to perpetuate or even enhance traditional values. With the remainder, death rituals have undergone changes exhibiting qualities more closely approximating exogenous Western values of personhood, family, community, and relations with the dead and other spirits. The book's overall conclusion roughly follows this division – on the one hand, that the restorative function classically attributed to mortuary rituals by the *Année Sociologique* school is "alive and well" in the Pacific; but on the other, in contexts of modernity, that function has become significantly complicated and compromised, with persons and communities partially failing to achieve closure and social unity. Pacific Islanders, therefore, have been left in various degrees of ambivalence about themselves, their traditions, and their experiences of outside worlds.

Laurence M. Carucci outlines the changes in kin and clan reckoning and attitudes towards spirits and chiefs among Marshallese Enewetak islanders following, first, missionization and the forced replacement of sea burial with burial on land and, second, forced relocation after WWII to allow for American nuclear weapons testing. Nancy C. Lutkehaus, in accord with Annette Weiner's model of "reproduction," traces out the changes in mortuary practice following from Manam islanders' similarly forced migration in the aftermath of a volcanic eruption, severing the people's consubstantial attachments to ancestral lands and, thereby, frustrating their ability to reproduce their own relations. Che Wilson and Karen Sinclair describe the pronounced plurality of simultaneous and discrepant voices expressed in contemporary *tangi* mortuary rites of Ngāti Rangī Māori people of Whanganui on New Zealand/Aotearoa's North Island. Understandings held by young and old, Catholic clergy and laity, Government and Māori, Pakeha and Māori, etc. persist despite their fundamental divergences. Nicholas A. Bainton and Martha Macintyre compare the different outcomes of industrialized mining among Lihir and Misima islanders. Lihirians channelled the material dividends of mineral extraction into a "glut" of hyper-traditional but destabilizing mortuary feasting. Misimans did so as well until the closure of their mine left them unable to repay the debts accumulated during the mining era and pondering the necessity of doing so. I'ai villagers as described by Joshua A. Bell experienced yet another outcome of the "structural violence" conditioned by commoditization and large-scale resource extraction (logging, natural gas, hydro projects); mortuary rituals have been significantly abridged, and the new practice of homestead buri-

als has contributed to increased anxieties, jealousies, and suspicions over sorcery. The book's two editors distinguish themselves from the other contributors in appealing to psychoanalytical theories to account for people's experiences of trauma occasioned by death and the effectiveness of mortuary rites to assuage them. Through a particularly complex chain of reasoning informed by Melanie Klein's theory of the fantasies of early infancy, David Lipset interprets the "knotted" Murik person's experiences of and reactions to death and mourning as revivals of the ambivalences and eventual reparations towards the mother (i.e., "good" versus "bad breast") in dialogue with the multitude of voices arising from modernity's sources. Eric K. Silverman argues that, while Iatmul mortuary rites may well rejuvenate society in the aftermath of death as proposed by Hertz, from a Freudian perspective they not only fail to resolve individual subjects' psychic experience of sorrow, pain, and angst, they actually thwart the alleviation of grief. Despite changes in personal identity and the loss of local autonomy instigated by outside forces, Kayan people's mortuary practices as described by Alexis Th. von Poser perpetuate the main outlines of earlier procedures, that is, reversing the temporal sequences à la Van Gennep by which children are formally initiated into adulthood. In a related vein, Doug Dalton's analysis of Rawa mortuary performances effectively inverts the conventional interpretation of the Hertzian scenario; rather than repairing the rifts to society occasioned by the deaths of its members, mortuary exchanges effect or complete the decomposition of the deceased's body, soul, and surviving relations, and in so doing set the stage for survivors freed of death *subsequently* to inaugurate *new* relations of social life through other institutions.

Each of these studies is to be praised for the heartfelt poignancy of the stories they tell, which are part and parcel of life in the Pacific today. The diversity of theoretical orientations informing those stories, which is impossible to cover adequately in a review of this nature, will also give readers much of great value to ponder. For beneath the somewhat superficial allegiance to the Bakhtinian dialogue trope, there is an abundance of theoretical perspectives worthy of interrogating for the extent of their compatibility or otherwise. These are the book's primary strengths.

On that point, though, I myself would have liked to see the editors undertake a more determined engagement with the conceptual convergences and divergences contained within the volume if not beyond it. Left as it is, I am uncertain of the conceptual advance that has been achieved through the unifying metaphor of "mortuary *dialogues*" beyond the concession that indigenous rituals over death and mourning in the context of modernity have engendered new and varied conversations and practices.

Finally, there is one critical elision which must be noted. From the days of the *Année Sociologique* to the present, new insights on the dynamics of mortuary ritual and sociality in general for the Pacific, and particularly for Melanesia, have emerged which have played a central role in revolutionizing anthropological thought on the

nature of kinship, ritual, and cosmology as well as gender. I refer here to the so-called New Melanesian Ethnography inspired by writings of Marilyn Strathern, Roy Wagner, and others focusing upon the partibility, transactability, and decomposition of persons and relations as enacted most dramatically, perhaps, in funerary rites. It just seems odd that only one of the volume's contributors (Dalton) has gone beyond paying lip service to this development, with the editors' "Introduction" and "Afterword" not even going that far. In any case, each of the volume's contributors in effect documents what amount to the systematically plural components of personhood in the communities they have studied – multiple detachable souls, bodies composed of diverse substances (e.g., semen, bone, blood, head) possessing distinct ritual capacities, associated relationships created and destroyed, and so on. Surely the talk and interactions between Pacific Islanders and external agents of modernity are not the only dialogues at play and worthy of interrogation in the contexts of both life and death. There are also those diverse "voices" partly internal to the social constitution of persons on which people's relations with outside others are premised and which are predicated by them.

Mark S. Mosko

McGill, Kenneth: *Global Inequality. Anthropological Insights.* Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2016. 127 pp. ISBN 978-1-4426-3451-0. Price: \$ 19.95

This is a welcome anthropological college textbook on surveying global human inequalities across different world regions, nation-states, and local cultural responses and initiatives. It accessibly discusses a complex and important subject now constantly studied and increasingly debated for creating new inequalities, especially by following these in terms of some "grounded interpretations of specific [ethnographic] cases" (3). The guiding inspiration is French anthropologist Marc Augé's felicitous formulation: "[t]oday, every ethnography must be an anthropology" (4). McGill's account, however, does not "involve any new research." Neither does it espouse any distinct theoretical position, nor a cultural, or economic, or political ideological stance in the book. Instead, as an eclectic American cultural anthropologist, the author "talks about global inequality today" in terms of the "actual relationships" in such diverse global-local conditions as, for example, in "squatter settlements in Brazil, factories in China, and high schools in the United States" (4).

To describe the general organizational structure of the book and its chapters' highlights is thus best to know more about this book. McGill's opening chapter introduces and situates some anthropologically signal mid- and late-twentieth-century comparative global and transnational studies. For example, the author underscores that there is "no single global system"; "inequality within the nation states" are as important to know as are its general trends under global economic inequality and capitalism. As these strands together construct "the global present," it is also often against the "colonial past" of diverse nation-states alongside the birth of anthropology. Only such